
MODEL OF VILLAGE DEVELOPMENT POLICY IMPLEMENTATION BASED ON SOFT SYSTEM METHODOLOGY

Siti Nuraini*

Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, Indonesia

*Correspondence: sitinurainiwahyu@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

received
revised
accepted

Keywords:

Policy Implementation Model,
Rural Development Policy,
Village Community Welfare.

ABSTRACT

The implementation of the policy model in village development is research based on problems in policy implementation, so that the welfare objectives to be achieved have not been realized, especially in twelve villages located in Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency, West Java Province. This research study uses an action research approach based on the Soft System Methodology which refers to the dual interests of research and problem management. This research focuses on the problem of the implementation model of the capability of village development policies to realize the welfare of rural communities. The results showed that the implementation of village development policies was carried out through policies to increase the basic needs of the community which had not been implemented optimally, so that the objectives of implementing village development policies for the welfare of village communities had not been realized. A village policy implementation model is needed that can be implemented properly and culturally with productivity, linearity, efficiency, policy substance, implementation behavior, target group participation, interaction of resources and networks, as important dimensions and determinants of implementation.

INTRODUCTION

After the implementation of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government and Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages (Village Law), development orientation is increasingly emphasized on regions and villages. This is an effort to provide answers to government governance policies with the principle of decentralization, which makes regional autonomy a tool in accelerating the achievement of equitable development for the realization of public welfare. The political and government reforms that have been going on for two decades have not had an optimal impact on the achievement of development in the village, so that policies for governance and development in villages are an important part of accelerating development (Wijayanti, 2017).

The regulation in government administration and village development refers to the Village Law, as one of the government's efforts to realize the welfare of village communities. The Village Law implies that the implementation of village governance is carried out in a democratic and effective manner in the process of implementing village autonomy and the principle of decentralization, as well as through the implementation of village development policies to alleviate poverty so that the welfare of rural communities is realized (Timotius, 2018).

To overcome the problem of poverty that occurs in rural communities in Indonesia requires cooperation and commitment from various parties related to both the central government, local government, village government and the village community itself, because poverty problems are interrelated with one another,

namely the level of income, education, health, access to goods and services, geographic location, gender and environmental conditions (Nurwati, 2008). Furthermore, this condition is followed by underdevelopment and unemployment which then escalates to inequality in society. So that poverty reduction becomes a priority in achieving the welfare of people's lives. As a rational reason that if gaps between groups of people and between regions stick up to the surface, then of course it will disrupt national development. Therefore the welfare of rural communities needs to be achieved through a village development policy program for poverty alleviation experienced by people in the village (Ras, 2013).

Article 78 of Law Number 06 of 2014 concerning Villages emphasizes that village development is carried out and is necessary to improve community welfare, improve the quality of human life and reduce poverty. The things that become the basis for village development policies take the meaning of the article that the policy strategies that must be formulated and implemented by local governments such as Bekasi District are: (1) fulfillment of basic needs; (2) development of village facilities and infrastructure; (3) development of local economic potential; and (4) sustainable use of natural resources and the environment (Roza & Arliman S., 2017). The four policy strategies are important targets that will be carried out by the Bekasi Regency Government as a research focus. While the development of rural areas, the planning is determined by the Regional Government in accordance with the Regional Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMD).

Conditions in the field indicate that the four village development policy strategies have not been optimally implemented in Bekasi District. In terms of meeting basic needs in the fields of education, health and other basic needs, it has not been optimal and has not been

evenly distributed. The high poverty rate, which reached 4.9% in 2016, is an indication of a problem in village development policies in Bekasi Regency.

Based on the normative explanation regarding the development policy strategy to achieve community welfare in Bekasi Regency, it is associated with facts and data related to the achievement of community welfare, especially in rural areas, which has not been achieved ideally. The existence of gaps or mismatches between normative development policies in Bekasi Regency and the realization of development achievements, is an important and interesting issue to be studied and researched further.

The research was conducted in one of the sub-districts in Bekasi Regency which is included in the Poor Subdistrict category as seen from the number of poor people in that area, namely Pebayuran District. The number of poor people in Pebayuran District is the highest when compared to other sub-districts in Bekasi Regency. Districts that have villages categorized as poor in Bekasi Regency and have welfare problems. The study was conducted with the main objective of analyzing the implementation of the Village Law policy with a research focus on village development policies and the research locus will be carried out in twelve villages in Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency. This study aims to: 1) evaluate and analyze the structuring of problem situations in the implementation of village development policies in Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency; 2) evaluating and analyzing Root definition and conceptual models in the implementation of village development policies by taking into account the dimensions and determinants of policy implementation in Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency; and 3) to analyze the comparison between conceptual models and the real world as well as systemically desired changes in Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency.

LITERATURE STUDY

Previous Soft System based Study

The focus of research on the implementation model of village development policies after the enactment of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages (Village Law), by evaluating and analyzing the implementation of the village development policies. The research will be conducted using the Soft System Methodology (SSM) research approach or the all-round soft systems methodology. Previous research related to village development policies and research related to policies using the SSM-based action research approach has been carried out, among others, by Tuti Herawati (2011), who conducted research aimed at knowing the HTR policy formulation process and analyzing the responses of program implementation. THR by designing a policy conceptual model so that the HTR program can be successful.

Similar research related to policies using the SSM research approach was carried out by Dharmono (2014) with the aim of analyzing governance restructuring, policy implementation and effective coordination of protected forest management. The results of research for rearrangement of governance in protected forest management can be carried out by changing systematically desirable and culturally feasible through the application of the principles of good governance.

Another research is a dissertation entitled Collaborative Governance of National Health Insurance Policy conducted by Widya Leksmanawati Habibie (2017) which is conducted with a focus on problems and obstacles in the implementation of the Social Security Administration (BPJS). The results of the study require collaboration in good governance between the central, provincial and regional governments as well as the BPJS and the community itself to overcome various obstacles or problems so that the BPJS program can be carried out according to the goal of providing

assurance of protection and welfare for all Indonesian people.

Research Approach

This research is an action research that uses the SSM research approach or the all-round soft system methodology, because this research is related to human activity systems (all systems of human activity) where the implementation model of village development policies is characterized by the presence of people in roles. social each always has the desire to carry out activities that have a purpose. As stated by Nandish V. Patel (1995) that: "SSM is a holistic approach to knowing the real and conceptual aspects of society, which views every incident as a Human Activity System because a series of human activities can be called a system, where every activity carried out is interrelated and forms a bond ". Another opinion Hardjosoekarto (2012, p. 50) states that:

The concept of Human Activities in SSM is the same as purposeful activities, not purposive activities. Purposeful activities are human activities that can be understood by looking at the concept of human identity which is considered to have readiness to give meaning to what one sees and experiences. In addition, humans also cannot depend on something that is meaningless (meaninglessness), because humans cannot stand to face the absence of meaning.

Human activity (human activity) or activities that have a purpose (purposeful activity) is a concept used in the SSM approach. The SSM method according to Hardjosoekarto (2012, p. 63), uses a combination of real-world exploration at the reality level (reality) and real-world exploration at the level of actuality (actuality). The same opinion was expressed by Uchiyama (2012, p. 76) who stated that:

In SSM based AR we are not concerned with such an existence of structures or systems in the reality level but interested in the possibility of

accommodation among people in the 'actuality' level.

The two opinions on SSM-based action research indicate that the action research approach or action research using the SSM method is included in the category of interpretivism paradigm as stated by Flood and Jackson in Hardjosoekarto (2012), namely "This SSM based AR is interpretivism in nature, in the sense that it uses systems as an organizing framework for thinking and not as a preparation of reality". This opinion states that interpretive in nature uses the system as an organizing framework for thinking and not as a representation of reality (Warren et al., 2019). This is also reinforced by the opinion of Checkland and Poulter (2006), that: "the SSM approach is very appropriate to use in research which sees that the (social) world is complex, problematic, mysterious, characterized by a battle of viewpoints". and using this type of action research approach through Soft System Methodology (SSM-based action research).

The research approach using action research is also based on the opinion that there are eleven methodological approaches in policy research, one of which is action research as research used to develop new approaches to solving problems (Hine & Lavery, 2014). This opinion is also supported by Mohamad Nazir (1988, p. 54) that the method of action research (actions research) is research aimed at determining future decision designs. On the basis of the description above, action research using the Soft System Methodology research approach can be used as a research method.

The Human Activity System which will be described in this study uses the SSM standard stages proposed by Checkland and Scholes (1999), there are 7 (seven) stages of activities in SSM dividing 2 parts in seeing problems in human activities, namely: 1) finding

problem situations that are not well structured (Problem situation considered problematic); 2) structuring the problem situation (problem situation expressed); 3) determine the root definitions of the relevant system (Root definitions of the relevant purposeful activity system); 4) create a conceptual model (Conceptual models of the systems named in the root definitions); 5) comparing stage 2 and stage 4 using a conceptual model comparison with real world situations (Comparison of models and real words); 6) determining the desired and feasible changes (Changes systematically desirable, culturally feasible); and 7) take an action to improve or improve the problem situation (Action to improve the situation). Stages 1 and 2 are the stages of finding (finding out). Then the 6th stage and 7th stage are the stages for carrying out action (taking action). The stages of Reality or perception about real world are stage 1, stage 2, stage 5, stage 6 and stage 7. In the system thinking stage, as a stage of actuality or feeling about real words, there are stage 3 and stage 4.

METHODOLOGY

In this study, a qualitative research design was used to obtain very complete and in-depth and reliable information. In addition, because qualitative research according to Creswell (2014, p. 4) is methods for exploring and understanding meaning, where some individuals or groups of people are considered to have originated from social or humanitarian problems. Through qualitative research, it can be revealed the answers to research questions as a whole by using descriptive methods for fact finding with the right interpretation, Whitney in Moh Nazir (1988, p. 63).

Primary data obtained through in-depth interviews and FGD activities were carried out using recording tools, then the results of the recordings were made transcripts. All the data obtained will be used to describe stages 1 to 6 SSM. The

technique of collecting data is by carrying out literature studies, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions (FGD). The research location was conducted in 12 villages located in the Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency. The basis for determining all villages in the Pebayuran District area is because the poverty rate for rural communities is higher than 168 other villages in 22 other sub-districts in Bekasi Regency.

Primary data obtained through in-depth interviews and FGD activities were carried out using recording tools, then the results of the recordings were made transcripts. All the data obtained will be used to describe stages 1 to 6 SSM. The technique of collecting data is by carrying out literature studies, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions (FGD). The research location was conducted in 12 villages located in the Pebayuran District, Bekasi Regency. The basis for determining all villages in the Pebayuran District area is because the poverty rate for rural communities is higher than 168 other villages in 22 other sub-districts in Bekasi Regency.

ANALYSIS

Problem

The implementation of village development policies in Pebayuran District still has several weaknesses and shortcomings so that the goal of improving community welfare has not been realized. The process of preparing the Village RPJM has been carried out in accordance with the provisions socialized by the sub-district, but the preparation uses a consultant and some are copy and paste from other RPJMDesa. The lack of prosperity of the village community is also caused by the lack of fulfillment of the basic needs of the village community. The need for education, in the period 2012-2017 based on the education index indicator obtained from the Bekasi District Education Office, the problem of education is seen from the Literacy Rate

(AMH) of 10 years old children there are 75.54% the remaining 24.46% are still illiterate. For Pebayuran District, there are still quite a lot of illiterate rural communities, namely 788 people.

Village community health problems can be seen from the community environment, behavioral factors as well as health and genetic services. Health problems in the Pebayuran District area, seen from environmental factors, generally the village community does not have their own latrines for defecating. In addition, health facilities in the village in the form of polyclinics / medical centers are not owned by every village, only eight places / facilities are available in Pebayuran District. Another problem related to the welfare of rural communities concerns village infrastructure problems, such as poor quality roads and drainage.

Root Definition

The root definition is a structured description of a human activity system that is relevant to the problematic situation of the focus of this study (Checkland & Poulter, 2020). The root definition describes the transformation process in organizations regarding what, how and why in relation to the transformation process in the organization. The definition of Roots that will be written in the implementation of village development policies is carried out using the formula "working P with Q to realize R, where PQR will answer the questions what, how, why" (Checkland & Poulter, 2006). The Root definition is made according to three research questions that will be answered through the use of a conceptual model. The theoretical approaches (research interests) and problem solving (problem solving) from McKay and Marshall (2001) are also used to provide a detailed description and analysis of the Root Definition.

Root definition based on theoretical (research interests) is divided into eight, namely: 1) productivity; 2) linearity; 3)

efficiency; 4) policy substance; 5) the behavior of the executing task; 6) participation; 7) resources; and 8) network interaction. Meanwhile, the root-based definition of problem solving focuses on the implementation of village development policies and the welfare of village communities.

a. Definitions of Roots research interests

In productivity transformation, the problems that arise are that the achievement of basic community needs services has not been fulfilled, program activities are sometimes ineffective, because they are not in accordance with the potential, problems and needs of the village community, women and children empowerment programs have not been implemented, social assistance programs have not been enjoyed or received the entire poor community, and infrastructure development has not been evenly distributed and what has been done for the construction of environmental roads has not been completed.

In linearity transformation, the problems that arise are training program activities, empowerment is carried out in general for 180 villages in the Bekasi Regency area, does not focus on villages in the Pebayuran District area, budget constraints for implementing program activities, social assistance programs have not enjoyed or accepted by all poor communities, community participation has not been optimal in the program of activities to improve services for the basic needs of the community, and SKPD as the implementer of activities has not involved the village government and village communities optimally.

In transformation of efficiency, an issue emerges on human resource quality owned by SKPD, Village Government and Community might the obstacles to increase the efficiency of organization, means and infrastructure that are insufficient to reach all villages in Bekasi Regency, so that the program won't be focused on each village, and lack of community participation in

program involvement related to the increase of basic needs service for village community, then, it won't be obstacles of SKPD performance.

In the transformation of the policy substance, the problem that arises is that the quality of human resources in village government and village communities is an obstacle in the preparation of the Village RPJM and in its implementation, the human resource factor greatly influences the implementation of village development policies, this concerns the level of education of village government officials and the community. the village itself, and the lack of optimization of the SKPD and the District Government in achieving the village development policy activity program, are obstacles in its implementation.

In the transformation of the implementing officers' behavior, the problem that arises is the lack of work motivation from the behavior of the implementing duties both from the SKPD and the village government in carrying out activities of village development policy programs, the not yet optimal empowerment of village government conducted by SKPD to implement village development policies There is cooperation between SKPD and village government to work together to mobilize participation and empower village communities to realize the implementation of village development policies.

In the transformation of participation, the problem that arises is the lack of acceptance from the village government and the village community for village development policy programs, the village government and village communities are not able to optimally contribute to the activities of village development policy programs, the role of SKPD is not optimal in program activities -Village development policy programs so that they become obstacles in the implementation of village development policy programs. In addition, the low level

of acceptance from the village government and village communities for village development policy programs, village governments and village communities is not able to optimally contribute to the activities of village development policy programs, and the role of SKPD is not optimal in policy programs village development.

In the transformation of resources, the problem that arises is that the lack of human resources and budget owned by the local government and village government has an impact on not optimal implementation of village development policy programs, so that other impacts, including the provision of road infrastructure, are not completed according to planning and material use. and improper technology causes roads that have been built not to last too long to be damaged.

In the transformation of network interactions, the problems that arise are the lack of network interaction between the SKPD and the village government and the village community in the preparation of the Village RPJM, the less optimal cooperation between the village government and the village community in the process of preparing the Village RPJM and the less optimal role of the sub-district government in providing direction or assistance so that the village is able to properly compile the village medium term development plan, there is no collaboration between the village government and the village community, and the village development policy programs are not implemented optimally.

Root Definition Based Problem Solving Interest

Refer to Checkland and Poulter's opinion (Checkland & Poulter, 2006) to solve problems using SSM. In the transformation of the implementation of village development policies, the problems that arise are the limited resources possessed by the Bekasi District SKPD, the limited capacity of village government

resources, and the village community will affect the implementation of village development policies carried out by improving services for the basic needs of the village community, so that it will hamper its realization. the welfare of the village community. In the transformation of community welfare, the problems that arise are the limited resources and finances owned by the Bekasi District SKPD and the limited capacity of village government resources, as well as limited community resources, especially in terms of education and weak abilities, limited facilities and infrastructure, lack of community participation. influencing the implementation of village development policies that are carried out by improving services for the basic needs of village communities, so that it will hinder the realization of the welfare of the village community.

Build a Conceptual Model

a. Research Interest Conceptual Model

The first conceptual model describes the productivity carried out in achieving village development policy standards, through policies to improve services for basic community needs. The fundamental thing in implementing village development policies must be in accordance with the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa. The determination of the village development program is based on the problems and needs of the village community, namely improving services for basic community needs in the fields of education, health, empowering women and children, building infrastructure and alleviating poverty and setting target performance standards.

In the framework of implementing village development program policies, a budget must be made according to the needs and prepare human resources who have the capacity to carry out their duties. Another important thing is that the implementing officers or persons or agencies who have the authority to implement village development policies, in

this case the related SKPD, District Government and Village Government, must coordinate with one another and establish good cooperation.

The next activity is to disseminate information to disseminate information related to the implementation of village development policies that will be implemented to all stakeholders, so that the implementation of village development policies through program policies to improve services for basic community needs can be socialized and run smoothly because of the support from all parties. Policy activities for community basic needs service improvement programs require supervision by the SKPD, District Government, Village Government, by the village community itself and all stakeholders so that all village development policy programs can run smoothly according to the predetermined plan.

The next activity that must be carried out by SKPD, District Government, Village Government, village communities and all stakeholders is to evaluate the implementation of village development policies, with the aim of making improvements to existing deficiencies or problems. The next step is to monitor the performance of the achievement of each of these activities, referring to the determination of the 3E performance criteria, namely Efficiency, Efficiency and Effectiveness. Related to the efficacy regarding the ongoing productivity in the implementation of village development policies, namely policies to improve services for the basic needs of the community. Efficiency concerns the minimum use of human resources and budget, while effectiveness is the achievement of productivity from previously less productive ones. All of these things are carried out in a series of control measures on the performance of the transformation process that takes place with the aim that performance can be achieved as planned.

The second conceptual model Regarding linearity in the implementation of village development policies, the implementation of village development policy activities must refer to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa. The implementation of the implementation of village development policies based on the problems and needs of the village community is stipulated in the Regional RPJM, namely a program policy to improve services for the basic needs of the community, likewise in 12 Villages in the Pebayuran Subdistrict area the RPJMDesa adjusts by implementing infrastructure development policies which are deemed very necessary and will have an impact on improving the economy to improve the welfare of the village community. Subsequently, authority is determined in its implementation so that there is a clear division of duties and responsibilities between the Regional Government and the Village Government as well as the source of the budget.

The next step, the suitability of the procedure against the implementation as well as the implementation time, is an activity that must be carried out in accordance with the planning. Funding for policy program activities to improve services for the basic needs of the village community must be in accordance with a predetermined budget, as well as the place or location for the activity to be carried out. The various policy activities of the village development program must involve the village community in the form of empowerment because the community is the target of the village development policy program, so for the success of the village development policy program the village community should not only be an object but also must be the subject of the policy. Central Government programs in alleviating rural communities' poverty as an effort to improve the welfare of village communities must be targeted at recipients so that the objectives of the program are achieved.

Every activity that has been achieved from several activity steps that have been made in the conceptual model above, its performance must be monitored in accordance with the determination of the 3E performance criteria, namely Efficiency, Efficiency and Effectiveness. The efficiency criteria relate to the implementation of village development policies that are linear in accordance with the stipulated provisions. Efficiency refers to the minimum use of resources, both human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure. Effectiveness is related to the implementation of the village development policy implementation linearly referring to the applicable provisions, where previously there was less linearity in its implementation. All activities made in the conceptual model are carried out in a series of control activities related to the performance of the ongoing transformation process, so that performance is achieved in accordance with predetermined plans.

The third conceptual model related to efficiency in the implementation of village development policies, it is necessary to determine the need for facilities and infrastructure, human resources according to the needs. The use of the budget in the activities of programs to improve the basic needs of the community as a form of implementation of village development policies. With regard to efficiency, the utilization of potential in the village must be carried out by using appropriate technology. The need to collaborate with various parties involved in the implementation of village development policy program activities and to include or involve the village community from the beginning to the end is needed to improve the welfare of the village community as the goal of achieving the implementation of village development policies.

The success of the implementation of village development policies is also supported by the participation of

stakeholders, namely NGOs, academics, Commission IV DPRD Bekasi Regency and village assistants, because it is necessary to collaborate with stakeholders. An equally important step is to supervise the implementation of the village development policy program so that it can be implemented according to plan. Efficiency concerns the ongoing activities of village development policies by carrying out efficiency. Associated with efficiency, namely the minimum use of human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure. Meanwhile, effectiveness is the achievement of increasing effectiveness in implementing village development policies that were previously ineffective. These various activities are carried out in control of the performance of the transformation process that takes place with the intention of achieving performance according to planning.

The fourth conceptual model is an increase in the substance of policies in the implementation of policies carried out by the Bekasi District SKPD and the Village Government related to policy programs to improve services for basic community needs. Various activities carried out regarding the implementation of the regional RPJMDesa and RPJMDesa formulation processes must comply with the provisions of the applicable regulations. For the Village RPJM, the preparation of the Village RPJM must be carried out through village meetings and the village community is involved. The next step is to determine a village development program plan according to the needs of the village community and determine the source of the budget that will be used both from the Village Fund, the Village Fund Allocation and from the Village Budget.

The implementation of village development policies that refer to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa must be appropriate in the framework of effectiveness and efficiency. There are standards set in the implementation of

village development policy activity programs, namely policy programs to improve services for the basic needs of the community. There is involvement of the village community both from the institutional elements of the village community such as the neighborhood association, community association, youth organization and the PKK. Community involvement or participation is carried out in the form of community empowerment in the implementation of village development policy activities. Give authority to stakeholders to find out and evaluate a series of village development policy activities as part of the strategy for achieving goals to improve the welfare of village communities.

The efficacy criteria are related to the ongoing implementation of village development policies in accordance with the substance of the policy. Efficiency concerns the use of minimum human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure, while effectiveness is the achievement of the implementation of village development policies that are already in accordance with the substance of the policy, where previously it was not in accordance with the substance of the policy. All of these activities are carried out through a series of performance control measures against the transformation process that takes place to achieve performance in accordance with the plan.

The fifth conceptual model relates to the behavior of the executor's task in implementing village development policies. The existence of good cooperation between SKPD and the District Government and Village Government as well as stakeholders in its implementation, the behavior of executing tasks from the elements of SKPD, District Government and village government has work motivation. The implementation of village development policies is socialized related to the policies of village development programs that will be implemented. Implementers have the

ability to carry out their duties and functions and are committed to achieving the objectives of village development program policies so that the welfare of village communities increases. Another thing that must be owned by implementing officers is having honesty in carrying out their duties and having targets for achieving village development program policies. For this reason, the behavior of the executive duties in carrying out their duties and functions must be optimal.

Village development policy implementation activities incur costs, therefore implementing officers must be transparent in the use of the budget. The success of implementing village development policies requires the involvement of the village community or the participation of the village community, which is carried out in the form of empowerment. One form of empowerment is by providing training to BUMDesa administrators for the progress of BUMDesa, so that the economy in the village can improve.

The efficacy concerns the ongoing behavior of the executor's duties in implementing village development policies. For efficiency related to the use of human resources, budget and minimum facilities and infrastructure. Meanwhile, the effectiveness regarding the achievement of increasing the behavior of the executing task in implementing village development policies was previously lacking in the behavior of the executing task in implementing village development policies. Each of these activities is carried out with a series of control measures on the performance of the transformation process that takes place so that performance can be in accordance with the predetermined plan.

The sixth conceptual model on participation describes participation in the implementation of village development policies by involving the participation of the village community in the process of drafting the Village RPJM. Therefore, it is

necessary to socialize the village development policy program so that it is known by all village communities. Participation is a form of village community involvement in village development policy program activities through the implementation of village community empowerment. Increasing the participation of village institutions and village community institutions is also a strategy in increasing village community participation. Furthermore, giving responsibility to the village community in implementing the village development policy program.

Increasing village community participation in the implementation of village development policies must also be done in collaboration with stakeholders to help through coaching activities for village communities. Stakeholders are also given the authority to observe, supervise and evaluate and provide input to local governments, sub-district governments and village governments in the process of implementing village development policies in order to achieve the objectives of implementing village development policies. The next activity is to conduct monitoring and evaluation activities carried out by the Regional Government, District Government, Village Government and village communities so that the implementation of village development policies can go according to plan, due to increased participation from the village community.

Efficiency refers to the ongoing participation of village communities in the implementation of village development policies. Efficiency is related to the minimum use of human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure, while effectiveness is related to the achievement of increased community participation in the implementation of village development policies, where previously the participation of village communities was still lacking. These various activities are carried out with a series of control measures on the

performance of the ongoing transformation process so that performance is achieved according to the predetermined plan.

The seventh conceptual model describes an increase in resources in the implementation of village development policies. This can be seen from the implementation of the village development policy program activities according to the plan. There are achievement targets that have been set in the implementation of the village development policy program. In addition, human resources as activity implementers have the required capacity and the amount is met as needed. The budget needed to carry out the village development program is available and sufficient as needed. Likewise, the availability of equipment needed to carry out the village development program and the technology used must be appropriate. Disseminating or disseminating various information related to village development policy programs. Utilizing the potential that exists in the village and the use of assets owned by the local government and village government are important steps that must be taken in implementing village development program policies in order to use the minimum budget. The involvement of the village community is very important because it is one of the keys to the smooth running of village development policies to achieve welfare goals for all village communities.

Efficacy involves the ongoing implementation of village development policies that use resources. Efficiency is the use of human resources, a minimum asset budget or facilities and infrastructure. While the effectiveness of the achievement of the objectives of implementing village development policies through sufficient resources. All of these activities are carried out by controlling the performance of the ongoing transformation process, so that performance can be realized according to plan.

The eighth conceptual model describes the interaction of networks in the

implementation of village development policies. The implementers, in this case the village government and the village community, establish a cooperative relationship in the preparation of the Village RPJM, in addition, a collaborative relationship is also carried out between the implementer and stakeholders in the context of implementing village development policy program activities. Cooperation relations are also carried out by SKPD, village government and village communities in carrying out village development policy program activities. Within the cooperative relationship, network interactions are established between SKPD, village government and village communities in various activities of village development policy programs. There is a determination of the authority of the SKPD, village government and village community in the village development policy program so that it is clear in the division of tasks and responsibilities of work and there is no overlap.

Establish a cooperative relationship with the facilitator in the implementation of the village community empowerment program, so that the aims and objectives of the village community empowerment program can be carried out according to plan. Communication and interaction between SKPD, sub-district government and village government as well as communication and interaction between sub-district government and village government and village community institutions during the implementation of village development policy program activities.

Efficacy is related to the criteria regarding the ongoing network interaction in the implementation of village development policies, while efficiency is a criterion in the use of minimum human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure in implementing village development policies and effectiveness as a criterion in achieving increased network interaction where previously interaction

Networking is still lacking in implementing village development policies through policies to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities. Various activities in the conceptual model are carried out with control over the performance of the transformation process that takes place with the intention that performance is achieved according to planning.

b. Conceptual Model based on Problem Solving Interest

The ninth conceptual model related to policy implementation in village development. First, the implementation of village development policies that refer to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa is where policies are stipulated to improve services for the basic needs of the village community. The implementation of village development policies must involve village community participation through village community empowerment activities. The implementation of the implementation of previous village development policies must be disseminated by the local government to village governments, village communities and stakeholders related to village development policy programs. The implementation must be carried out by providing assistance to the village community so that the activities of village development policy programs can be carried out properly. Another important thing is that human resources as the implementer of activities must be assigned the capacity to carry out their duties properly and responsibly.

The budget that will be used in connection with the implementation of village development policy program activities is determined as needed and is carried out with transparency in its determination and use. The next activity is to coordinate with the implementers of the village development policy program activities, as well as oversee the implementation of the village development policy program and evaluate it carried out

by the local government, village government and by the village community itself and stakeholders. Performance monitoring is carried out on each achievement of the various activities guided by the determination of the 3E performance criteria, namely Efficiency, Efficiency and Effectiveness.

Efficacy is related to the sustainability of the implementation of village development policies, namely policies to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities. Efficiency concerns the minimum use of human resources, budget and facilities and infrastructure in its implementation. Effectiveness is the achievement and optimization of the implementation of village development policies in carrying out policy programs to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities, where previously the implementation of village development policies was not optimal. These various activities are carried out through control measures on the performance of the ongoing transformation process.

The tenth conceptual model is related to the welfare of village communities, as the ultimate goal of implementing village development policies carried out through policies to improve services for the basic needs of village communities. The initial steps taken through the implementation of village development policies through policies to improve services for the basic needs of the community can be carried out as planned. Various village development policy programs can be achieved, namely improving education services, improving health services, increasing protection services for women and children and developing infrastructure that has been planned by each village. The village community receives and feels the positive impact of the village development policies that have been implemented.

The various poverty alleviation assistance provided by the central

government can be felt equally by all people whose lives live within the poverty line. The involvement of the village community as a form of village community participation through village community empowerment activities carried out by the local government and village government in the process of implementing village development program policies can have an impact on improving the welfare of the village community.

Efficacy is related to the ongoing implementation of village development policies as a form of government efforts to create a prosperous community life. Efficiency is related to the use of minimum human resources, budget, facilities and infrastructure in implementing village development policies. Meanwhile, effectiveness concerns the achievement or realization of an increase in the welfare of the village community, which was originally less prosperous in the village community. The various activities carried out are carried out in a series of activities to control the performance of the ongoing transformation process.

Conceptual Model Comparison

The fifth stage of SSM is the stage for comparing real-world problematic situations with conceptual models which are intellectual tools for discussing real-world problematic situations, which are not a complete picture of the real world but as duplicates related to all relevant and selected systems of human activity (Bernardo et al. , 2018). The model that has been created is then constructed according to the logic of the researcher (logic based). In addition, the model that has been made is not perceived at the comparison stage as the most correct or perfect model for assessing real-world problematic situations, but rather the conceptual model of the activity system is only a tool that enables managed discussion (Checkland and Poulter, 2006).

The results of the comparison of the conceptual model with real world conditions result in the implementation of the policies described in the next section.

a. Research Interest Based Comparison

In the first model on productivity, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to: the alignment of the Village RPJMD with the Regional RPJMD; fulfillment of people's basic needs through improving education, health services, poverty alleviation, empowering women and protecting children and fulfilling infrastructure; primary education school-age children are increasingly well served; the availability of adequate health service places to provide basic health services for rural communities and community partnerships in health services such as posyandu can improve the quality of community health; community involvement in development can create a good quality infrastructure development; empowerment of rural communities can reduce the poverty rate of people in the village; the budget is determined according to the needs of the village development policy program; there is a cooperative relationship between the Village Government and the District Government and the Regional Government; provide information and explanations about the policy program to improve services for basic community needs to stakeholders; the activities of the village development policy program are supervised by all related parties, so that they can run according to the stipulated provisions and plans; and evaluation by SKPD, District Government, Village Government, village communities and stakeholders of various village development policy activities that have been implemented.

In the second model of linearity, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to:

The suitability of the village development policy program with the problems and needs of the village community; capacity of human resources / personnel implementing village development policy programs according to needs; the suitability of the village development policy program with its implementation in the village; implementation of the village development policy program refers to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa which prioritize infrastructure development; refers to revenues originating from the central government, assistance from the provincial government and local governments; village development policy programs are implemented in accordance with APBDesa; refers to the Village RPJM and the Regional RPJM; village community involvement in the formation of the Village RPJM Compilation Team, village development planning deliberations, village meetings, village level workshops; and the existence of several social assistance programs for rural communities such as the routine program, fertilizer assistance, seeds for farmers and rice for the poor (Raskin)

In the third model on efficiency, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to: identification of the necessary facilities and infrastructure through village deliberations; determine the number and capacity of human resources as needed; the budget that has been allocated for the village development activity program is used as efficiently as possible; utilize existing human resources in the village from elements of the community and village government in the village development policy program; use appropriate facilities and infrastructure such as equipment in accordance with the activities of the village development policy program; carry out development planning deliberations (musrembang) at the sub-district level; carry out village community empowerment activities; involving

stakeholders in the form of guidance to village communities, monitoring and evaluation; and village development policy programs through policies to improve services to the needs of village communities, the implementation of which is supervised by the local government, village government, and NGOs.

In the fourth model regarding to the substance of policy, the result of the comparison between the model and the real world is the implementation of policies that refer to: the activities for the preparation of the Village RPJM refers to Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages, Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs No. 114 of 2014 concerning Guidelines for Village Development; implementation of village development planning deliberations; holding village level deliberations to obtain development program proposals from the village community; identifying problems in the village and proposing infrastructure development programs from village communities; carry out the preparation of a village development program budget; alignment of village development policy directions with district development policies; determine indicators of achievement of village development policy programs; policy program to improve services for basic needs of rural communities; collaborating with various elements of society to be involved in implementation and supervision; proposed village community empowerment programs; and collaborating with stakeholders in implementing village development policies.

In the fifth model on the behavior of the executing task, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to: communicating, coordinating with one another according to the authority they have in implementing village development policies; SKPD, District Government and village government cooperate in carrying out their

duties; information from reliable sources is essential for the success of village development programs; determine the implementer of the task according to their expertise or ability; executing officers carry out their duties and responsibilities according to the authorities they have; executor works in accordance with his / her authority; executors work in accordance with predetermined achievement standards; village development policy activities are carried out optimally; disclosure of information related to village development policy program budgets; village communities involved in village infrastructure development activities programs; and training on management of BUMDesa from the Ministry of Health PDTT.

In the sixth model regarding to the target group participation, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to: objective conditions in the field which form the basis for the formulation of the RPJMDesa; the sub-district government delivers information on village development policies from the local government to the village government through weekly sub-district meetings; in the implementation of infrastructure development such as environmental roads, bridges, irrigation and others, the village community is involved according to their abilities; planning community empowerment programs compiled in APBDesa; empowerment of village communities is limited to the provision of office stationery facilities, meeting consumption and official trips for Posyandu, UP2K and BKB; the village head as the person in charge and activator of the village community in the implementation and success of achieving the village development program; provide information on the objectives and activities of the village development policy program; involvement in Musrenbang meetings at the sub-district and village

levels; and the involvement of the village community in monitoring the implementation of village development programs.

In the seventh model on resources, the result of the comparison between the model and the real world is the implementation of policies that refer to: Local and village governments play an important role in village development programs; refers to the formulation of the vision and mission as well as the goals and objectives of the Regional RPJMD and RPJMDesa; limited human resources in implementing village development programs; formulating and stipulating a village development program budget by the Village Government and the Village Consultative Body (BPD); available equipment needed in infrastructure development; infrastructure development program in the village, using the appropriate tools; the regional government through the sub-district government informs the village development program policies and is forwarded by the sub-district to all villages and stakeholders through weekly sub-district meetings; involve village communities in village infrastructure development programs; village development program activities using local government and village government assets; and village community involvement is carried out in the infrastructure development program implemented by the village

In the eighth model on network interaction, the results of the comparison between the model and the real world are the implementation of policies that refer to: cooperation in the RPJMDesa formulation process between the village government and the village community has been carried out in village deliberations and workshops; carry out coordination, communication and guidance activities, as well as provide input to the village government and village communities; there is a division of authority in the implementation of the village development

policy program; coordination carried out so that the implementation of village development programs can run smoothly and smoothly; the authority based on the policy program in improving the basic needs of the village community which is implemented; the village assistant team provides information and input to the village government for the smooth implementation of village development policies; coordination between SKPD and sub-district governments and between sub-district governments and village governments; and cooperation in implementing village infrastructure development.

b. Comparison Based on problem solving interest

The comparison between the conceptual model and the real world regarding the implementation of village development policies, namely the conceptual model activities, the real conditions for the implementation of the village development policies are described in questions, and alternative actions.

In the ninth model about optimizing the implementation of village development policies, the result of the comparison between the model and the real world is the conceptual model activity:

- 1) carry out activities for implementing village development policies referring to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa, namely policies to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities with current conditions that are less than optimal so that the alternative action is the implementation of activities carried out by SKPD related to programs to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities
- 2) involving the participation of the village community with the current conditions that are less than optimal so that the alternative

- action is to examine the process of preparing the Village RPJM;
- 3) conducting empowerment activities for the village community with the current conditions that are less than optimal so that the alternative action is to be done collectively by DPMD, for the Manpower Office because the location of the training is very far from Pebayuran District;
 - 4) carry out socialization activities to the village government, village communities and stakeholders regarding the village development policy program with the current conditions being optimal so that alternative actions are carried out in the Regent's Office, District Office and Village Office;
 - 5) conducting assistance activities to village communities with the current conditions that are not optimal so that the alternative action is to examine the stakeholders & village assistant teams that provide assistance to the community in the village development program;
 - 6) Determine human resources who have the capacity to carry out their duties with the current conditions optimally so that alternative actions by improving the conditions of education level, knowledge and competence are in accordance with the needs of the program to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities;
 - 7) Determining the budget according to the current conditions is less than optimal so that the alternative action is to increase the budget according to the need, so that the empowerment program and infrastructure development can be achieved;
 - 8) Conducting financial transparency with current conditions is optimal so that alternative measures are reviewed by reviewing the documentation related to village development program financing, namely APBDesa;
 - 9) coordinating with the implementers of village development policy program activities with the current conditions that are less than optimal so that alternative actions focus on NGOs to better understand the problems of village development programs and more actively assist the community to be involved in village development programs; and
 - 10) Carrying out supervision and evaluation by the local government, village government and village communities as well as village stakeholders with current conditions that are less than optimal so that alternative actions are necessary to make a schedule of continuous monitoring and evaluation activities in weekly meetings at the sub-district and village levels.
- In the tenth model regarding the welfare of rural communities**, the results of the comparison of the model with the real world are conceptual model activities:
- 1) implementing village development policies through policies to improve services for basic community needs is carried out as planned, with current conditions not optimal so that the alternative action is to evaluate , to obtain feedback on determining the next steps in the village development program;
 - 2) the achievement of improved education services, with the current condition is not optimal so that the alternative action is to increase the budget and human resources to be able to provide opportunities for school age children to receive education;
 - 3) achievement of improved health services, with current conditions

- less than optimal so that the alternative action is to increase the budget to provide free national health social security services, especially for the poor, and to increase health personnel in Puskesmas such as doctors, matrices, midwives and nurses;
- 4) The achievement of improving protection services for women and children, with the current conditions being less than optimal so that the alternative action is to create a child-friendly area, establish a Regional Child Protection Commission (KPAD), establish a call center that is directly connected to DP3A as a counseling place for women who experience domestic violence (KDRT);
 - 5) the achievement of infrastructure development, with the current condition is less than optimal so that the alternative action is to continue the settlement by budgeting for the next infrastructure development program;
 - 6) poverty alleviation assistance activities are accepted by all people who are categorized as poor in the village with the current condition that not all of the poor have received it so that the alternative action is to collect data for people who have not received assistance for the following year;
 - 7) Village community participation activities in the form of village community empowerment in the implementation of village development program policies, with the current conditions being less than optimal so that the alternative action is to prepare a community empowerment program plan for the next year's budget;
 - 8) the community accepts and feels the positive impact of the village

development policy, with the current conditions being less than optimal so that the alternative action is to continue in the village development budget for the following year; and

- 9) The life of the village community is prosperous, with the current conditions less than optimal so that the alternative action is to increase the budget to fulfill the basic needs of the village community.

5. Expected changes

In implementing village development policies the role of local government and village government and village communities is very important for smooth implementation, in order to realize the objectives of village development policies for the welfare of village communities. In implementing the village development policy as a research interest which becomes the reference reference for this research, namely the local government, village government and village communities. These three elements have an important role in the implementation and achievement of the implementation of village development policies.

Hamdi (2014) states that in policy implementation, attention to the dimensions of productivity, linearity and efficiency is supported by various determinants that influence the success of policy implementation, namely policy substance, behavior of executing tasks, network interactions, participation of target groups and resources. Referring to this opinion to obtain novelty from this research, a model for implementing village development policies to realize the welfare of rural communities will be described. The following table will show changes that are systemically desirable and culturally feasible in relation to the dimensions and determinants of implementing village development policies according to research interests.

Table 1. Systematically Desirable and Culturally Feasible related to the Policy Implementation of Village Community Welfare (research Interest)

No.	Name of RDs	<i>Desirable</i>	<i>Feasible ?</i>	<i>Possible action</i>
1	Produktivitiy	Assign village development program implementing officers according to their capacity to carry out their duties and responsibilities	Yes, the village development program according to the needs of the village community is carried out by the related SKPD.	Local governments evaluate the effectiveness of activities that have been carried out and the benefits for the community
2	Linierity	Conformity in the process of meeting implementation standards with the implemented program of activities.	Yes, the village development policy program is carried out according to the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa	In the preparation of the village medium term development plan, it is necessary to complement with an implementation time and budget plan There is assistance from local and sub-district governments in the preparation of the Village Medium Term Development Plan The village assistant team provides input and assistance for the completeness of the preparation of the Village RPJM document
3	Efficiency	Use resources as effectively as possible	Yes, the budget for the village development program, the executor of the task and the technology used are carried out according to need	Increased budget for village infrastructure development programs, Intensive cooperation between local government and village government as well as stakeholders to provide guidance to village government and village communities. Increase community empowerment programs according to the needs of village communities.
4	Substance of policy	RPJMDaerah & RPJMDesa are made according to existing problems and for the welfare of the community	Yes, there is a harmony between the Regional RPJMD and the Village RPJM	Cooperation with related elements in the implementation of the village development program is carried out through a program to improve services for the basic needs of the community
5	Implementer behavior	Have the ability, responsibility and motivation to work	Yes, the executor is determined in accordance with the required capacity	Increasing the number and quality of health and teaching staff and raising awareness of the importance of village development programs
6	Target Group Participation	Carry out community empowerment related to village development policy program policies	Yes, the activity was carried out through training to improve sewing skills, make salted eggs, make doll clothes	Village community empowerment programs are carried out in sub-districts according to the potential and needs of the community
7	Resources	Fulfill the resources needed in implementing village development programs	Yes, village development programs can be implemented through the availability of implementers and sufficient funds	Improving the quality of human resources in village government and village communities
8	Work Net Interaction	Cooperation between local governments and village governments, stakeholders and village communities	Yes, through a relationship of authority in village development program activities	It is necessary to increase cooperation between local government and village government with village communities and stakeholders in implementing village development programs

Source: Author, 2021.

Whereas the changes that are desired and can be made refer to problem solving interests related to the implementation of

village development policies and the welfare of village communities can be seen based on the following table:

Table 2. Systematically desirable and culturally feasible related to policy implementation and village community welfare (problem solving interest)

No	Name of RDs	<i>Desirable</i>	<i>Feasible?</i>	<i>Possible action</i>
1	Implementation of village development policies through policy dimensions and determinants	It has been implemented, it needs to be optimized through increased cooperation between local governments and village governments and village communities and stakeholders	Yes, through a clear division of authority and conducting regular scheduled meetings as a forum for coordination and evaluation of the implementation of village development program activities	Increasing the quality and quantity of resources related to village development programs, in the form of increasing the quality and quantity of human resources, funds or budget as well as the technology used
2	Village community welfare through optimizing the implementation of village development policies	The implementation of policies to improve services for the basic needs of the community is carried out optimally	Yes, through the preparation of the Regional RPJMDa and RPJMDesa which is based on the potential, basic needs and welfare issues	Increase village community empowerment activities focused on each sub-district according to the potential and capacity of the village community

Source: Author, 2021

CONCLUSION

The purpose of this research is to analyze the implementation model of village development policies in realizing the welfare of rural communities, referring to the three dimensions of policy implementation, namely the dimensions of productivity, linearity and efficiency and five determinants of policy implementation, namely policy substance factors, the behavior of executors, participation of target groups and resources. The results of the study that have been carried out can be concluded that the results of the analysis found 8 factors in the implementation of village development policies seen from the 3 dimensions and 5 determinants of policy implementation.

The first dimension of productivity is very important in the achievement of village development policies through the ability of the implementers in this case the related SKPD, village government and stakeholders as implementing elements to realize the achievement of standards that have been set in village development program activities according to their duties and responsibilities as well as the authorities they have, related with

programs to improve services for the basic needs of rural communities. The role of these four elements is crucial in the implementation and achievement of the objectives of the village development program policies.

The second dimension is linearity, related to conformity in meeting implementation standards with the program of activities being carried out. This can be supported because both the Regional RPJMDa and the Village RPJM are in harmony or synchronous, so that village development activities take place in line with those planned by the local government and the village government. In addition, there will be no overlapping in both budgeting and implementation.

The third dimension is efficiency which relates to the ability to use budget, technology and human resources in implementing village development program policies through the determination of human resources according to the capacity needed and budget determination based on planning as outlined in the APBD and APBDes as well as the technology used according to the needs in program implementation. village development.

Another study found in this study concerns the factors that greatly influence the success in implementing village development policies, namely the determinants of policy implementation consisting of the first determinant of policy substance, in the implementation of village development policies it is shown that there is Village development is indicated by the harmony between the Regional RPJMDa and the Village RPJM, both of which are arranged according to the needs of the village community to overcome welfare problems so that the village community can have a prosperous life.

The second determinant, the behavior of the executor's duties, the roles and responsibilities as well as the work motivation of the executor is very important in achieving the objectives of the program to improve services for the basic needs of the village community.

The third determinant of the participation of the target group, namely the village community in the implementation of village development policies through policies to improve services for basic community needs, requires community participation by carrying out community empowerment activities, because village communities are very important objects and subjects for the village development policy program.

The determinants of the four resources are no less important factors in the implementation of the village development program, because they involve financing that requires funds, human resources, technology and equipment used.

The fifth determinant is network interaction concerning cooperation between institutions / institutions, as well as between local and village governments, as well as village communities and stakeholders in accordance with their authority in implementing village development policies.

The implementation of the village builder policy has a welfare objective for the village community, from the description above, the implementation has not been carried out optimally so that the welfare of the village community in the Pebayuran District area is not yet prosperous. It takes commitment from all elements involved in village development policies to achieve prosperity.

REFERENCE

- Bernardo, H., Gaspar, A., & Henggeler Antunes, C. (2018). A Combined Value Focused Thinking-Soft Systems Methodology Approach to Structure Decision Support for Energy Performance Assessment of School Buildings. *Sustainability*, *10*(7), 2295. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10072295>
- Checkland, P., & Poulter, J. (2006). *Learning for Action: A Short Definitive Account of Soft Systems Methodology and its use for Practitioners, Teachers and Students*. John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
- Checkland, P., & Poulter, J. (2020). Soft Systems Methodology. Dalam M. Reynolds & S. Holwell (Retired) (Ed.), *Systems Approaches to Making Change: A Practical Guide* (hlm. 201–253). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4471-7472-1_5
- Checkland, P., & Scholes, J. (1999). *Soft systems methodology: A 30-year retrospective*. John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
- Creswell, J. C. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. SAGE Publications.
- Dharmono. (2014). *Tata Kelola Dalam Pengelolaan Hutan Lindung*. Universitas Terbuka.
- Habibie, W. L. (2017). *Tata Kelola Kolaboratif Kebijakan Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional*. Universitas Indonesia.

- Hardjosoekarto, S. (2012). *Soft Systems Methodology: Metode Serba Sistem Lunak*. UI-Press.
- Herawati, T. (2011). *Hutan Tanaman Rakyat: Analisis Proses Perumusan Kebijakan dan Rancang Bangun Model Konseptual Kebijakan*. Institut Pertanian Bogor.
- Hine, G., & Lavery, S. D. (2014). Action research: Informing professional practice within schools. *Issues in Educational Research*, 24(2), 162–173.
- Nazir, M. (1988). *Metode Penelitian*. Penerbit Ghalia Indonesia.
- Nurwati, N. (2008). Kemiskinan: Model Pengukuran, Permasalahan dan Alternatif Kebijakan. *Jurnal Kependudukan Padjadjaran*, 10(1), 1.
- Patel, N. V. (1995). Application of soft systems methodology to the real world process of teaching and learning. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 9(1), 13–23.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/09513549510075998>
- Ras, A. (2013). Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Sebagai Upaya Pengentasan Kemiskinan. *SOCIUS: Jurnal Sosiologi*, 56–63.
- Roza, D., & Arliman S., L. (2017). Peran Badan Permusyawaratan Desa di Dalam Pembangunan Desa dan Pengawasan Keuangan Desa. *Padjajaran Journal of Law*, 4(3), 606–624.
- Timotius, R. (2018). Revitalisasi Desa dalam Konstelasi Desentralisasi menurut Undang-Undang Nomor 6 Tahun 2014 Tentang Desa. *Jurnal Hukum & Pembangunan*, 48(2), 323–344.
<https://doi.org/10.21143/jhp.vol48.no2.1666>
- Uchiyama, K. (2012). Preliminary discussion of Validity and Legitimacy of SSM-based AR. Dalam G. Bagakis & S. Georgiadou (Ed.), *Action research for improvement in schools, communities and organizational spaces: What is to be done?* Manchester Metropolitan University.
- Warren, S., Sauser, B., & Nowicki, D. (2019). A Bibliographic and Visual Exploration of the Historic Impact of Soft Systems Methodology on Academic Research and Theory. *Systems*, 7(1), 10.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/systems701010>
- Wijayanti, S. N. (2017). Hubungan Antara Pusat dan Daerah Dalam Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia Berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014. *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 23(2), 186–199.