

Implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach Tourism Destination Development Program as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK), West Sumatra Province, Indonesia

Author:

Nurul Fasdiah¹, Pratiwi Nurhascaryani², Mutia Rahmah^{3*}

Affiliation:

Governance Institute of Home Affairs Jakarta, South Jakarta, 12560, **Indonesia**^{1,2,3}

e-Mail:

nurulfasdiah94@gmail.com¹, pratiwinurhascaryani@ipdn.ac.id²,
mutiarahmah@ipdn.ac.id³

***Corresponding author**

Mutia Rahmah

Governance Institute of Home Affairs Jakarta (IPDN)

Email: mutiarahmah@ipdn.ac.id

Received: September 09, 2021

Revised : December 06, 2021

Accepted: December 07, 2021

Available Online: January 18, 2022

Abstract

The Tourism and Culture Department has made a program to develop the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK), West Sumatra Province, Indonesia. However, this program has been hampered by a lack of suitable facilities and infrastructure, tourism resources and funds, and a low level of promotion and investment. Therefore, this study aims to identify and analyze the implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK) in West Sumatra Province. The descriptive qualitative approach using the inductive method was employed, and the data collection was conducted through interviews, observation, and documentation techniques. Furthermore, purposive and snowball sampling approaches were used to identify the informants. Data collection techniques include condensation, presentation, and drawing conclusions. The results show that implementing the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK), West Sumatra Province, is not ideal, as evidenced by the non-linearity of standards with costs and the inefficient allocation of funds.

Keywords: Policy Implementation; Tourism Destination Development; City Tourism Strategic Area

Abstrak

Dinas Pariwisata dan Kebudayaan telah membuat program pengembangan destinasi wisata Pantai Gandoriah-Sunur sebagai Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Kota (KSPK) Pariaman Provinsi Sumatera Barat. Namun program ini belum didukung sarana dan prasarana, sumber daya pariwisata, dan dana yang memadai, serta tingkat promosi dan investasi yang masih rendah. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui dan menganalisis implementasi program pengembangan destinasi wisata Pantai Gandoriah-Sunur sebagai Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Kota (KSPK) Pariaman Provinsi Sumatera Barat. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah dengan pendekatan kualitatif deskriptif metode induktif. Teknik pengumpulan data dalam penelitian ini melalui wawancara, observasi, dan dokumentasi. Penentuan informan yang diwawancarai dengan menggunakan teknik *purposive sampling* dan *snowball sampling*. Teknik pengumpulan data dimulai dari pengumpulan data, kondensasi data, penyajian data, dan penarikan kesimpulan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa implementasi program pengembangan destinasi wisata Pantai Gandoriah-Sunur sebagai Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Kota (KSPK) Pariaman Provinsi Sumatera Barat belum optimal sebagaimana tampak dari belum linearnya standar dengan biaya dan belum efisiennya dana yang dialokasikan.

Kata kunci: Implementasi Kebijakan; Pengembangan Destinasi Wisata; Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Kota

INTRODUCTION

Tourism is one of the essential pillars of the national economy (Winia, Ginaya, Mudana, & Widana, 2019). It has also been widely used as a sector contributing to economic growth in various developing and developed countries. The contribution can be in several ways, such as income from foreign currencies, attracting international investors to invest, increasing tax revenues, and creating additional jobs (Yakup, 2019). Furthermore, tourism's growth and development contribute as a critical sector to the country's foreign exchange earnings (Samimi, 2011). This contribution can be seen in 2018 and 2019, where Indonesia's foreign

exchange in 2018 was around IDR 270 trillion with a percentage of 12.58% compared to the average world growth of only 5.6% and was increased in 2019 to IDR 280 trillion (National, 2019).

In 2019, the transportation and tourism sector grew by 3.5%, which exceeded the global economic growth of 2.5% for nine consecutive years (World Travel and Tourism Council, 2019). This is undoubtedly an important sector in Indonesia. Several new jobs have been established in the tourism sector during the last five years; therefore, they can be exploited as an alternative source of employment. In 2019, the number of foreign tourists visiting Indonesia was 16.10 million, and it is a 1.9 percent increase compared to

the previous year. Furthermore, the competitiveness of travel and tourism placed 40th out of 140 countries with an Index score of 4, 3 out of 5, also improved (World Travel and Tourism Council, 2019).

Law Number 23 of 2014 on Regional Government states that tourism is a government affair of choice in regencies/cities and provinces. This matter is the responsibility of the Tourism and Culture Department and other nomenclatures following their respective regions' regulations. The diversity of tribes, languages, flora, fauna, and culture in each region attracts domestic and even foreign tourists to travel.

Since Pariaman City is located in a coastal area, it has significant potential for the fisheries and tourism sector. Furthermore, the sloping beach conditions, blue seawater, pine forests adorning the coast, and seven coastal areas that attract tourists create an appealing natural beauty to these areas. The development of the number of visits can be seen in Table 1 below.

Table 1. The Development of the Number of Tourist Visits to Pariaman City

Year	Tourists		Number
	Foreign	Domestic	
2015	1.146	2.674.523	2.675.669
2016	628	2.907.194	2.907.822
2017	690	3.009.310	3.010.000
2018	817	3.431.670	3.432.487
2019	1.230	3.801.770	3.803.000

Source: Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2019

Based on table 1, the number of domestic and foreign tourist visits to Pariaman City tourism destinations from 2015 to 2019 has increased. The Pariaman City government uses the increase in the number of tourist visits to improve the economy and welfare of the local community.

The more dominant tourist attraction is nature, such as the beach. Gandoriah-Sunur Beach is a collection of 7 coastal areas in Pariaman City. It consists of Gandoriah, Cermin, Kata, Talao Pauh, Talao Manggung, Teluk Belibis, and Sunur. Each beach has its uniqueness and charm, but Gandoriah is one of the most famous.

Through the Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, the government created a Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program as a City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK) to overcome the strategic planning problem of Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department for 2018-2023.

In implementing the program, various problems are still found, including the existence of coastal tourism destinations that adequate facilities and infrastructure have not supported. For example, the existing tourism transportation facilities are only in trains, but the distance between the station and the tourism destination is quite long, about 2 km. Furthermore, the beach building facilities provided for traders are far from tourism destinations; therefore, they are abandoned (Yuliviona, 2020). Another problem is the supporting facilities such as hotels, homestays, and restaurants that get less attention from the local

government. The number of these facilities can be seen in table 2.

Table 2. Number of Tourism Supporting Facilities in Pariaman City

Year	Type		
	Hotel	Homestay	Restaurant
2015	9	11	30
2016	9	11	30
2017	9	11	30
2018	9	11	30
2019	9	11	30

Source: Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2019

From 2015 to 2019, tourism business and service actors in Pariaman City experienced stagnation partly due to the local government's lack of guidance and development.

The promotion, which is still considered low, primarily through social media, is also a problem. The promotional activities carried out through social media can be seen in table 3.

Table 3. Promotion of Pariaman City Tourism Destinations through Social Media

Social Media Types	Number		Year Founded
	OFollower	Video/Post	
Youtube: <i>Pariaman Tourism</i>	36	4	2020
Instagram : <i>Beautiful-pariaman</i>	133	81	2020

Source: Processed by Researchers, 2020

Based on table 3, promotional activities through social media were only conducted in 2020. The results of

the promotions were still not ideal, as seen by the low number of subscribers and followers. This figure is used to calculate the number of people who have expressed an interest in watching more content on available accounts. (Creatoracademy.youtube.com, 2020). The low level of promotion also impacts the minimal number of investors. The local government's lack of interest in expanding the tourism business in Pariaman City explains the low number of investors.

Related previous studies include the development of waterfront tourism areas focused on Gandoriah Pariaman Beach (Yuspi, I Nengah, & Jonny, 2021), the potential and strategy for developing sharia beach tourism focused on Santen Island, Banyuwangi Regency (Hadi & Ari, 2017), analysis of strategy for developing Lake Bandar Kayangan Tourism Object in Pekanbaru City (Sabri, 2015), strategy for developing tourism potential at Duta Beach, Probolinggo Regency (Bahiyah, Riyanto, & Sudarti, 2018), tourism destination development strategy for Bongo Village, Gorontalo Regency (Demolingo, 2015), and strategies for developing marine tourism in Betoambari Sub-district, Bau-Bau City (Bashiru, Fattah, & Kasnir, 2019). They show differences from the results of this study, focused on the development of tourism destinations from the perspective of public policy. Therefore, this study aim to determine and analyze the implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK), West Sumatra Province.

METHOD

This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach with an inductive method, and the data collection is carried out through interviews, observation, and documentation techniques. The informants are determined using purposive and snowball sampling techniques, including four people from the Tourism and Culture Department, three domestic tourists, three business people, and three people living in the tourism area.

According to Miles, Huberman, and Saldana, this study uses data analysis techniques: collection, condensation, presentation, and conclusion or verification (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2014).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program is one Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department program for 2018-2023. The tourism destination development program elaborates the Pariaman City vision and mission. Furthermore, the elected regional and deputy regional heads are formed by the Tourism and Culture Department. This program is based on the Pariaman City vision for 2018-2023, namely "Pariaman City of Tourism, Trade, Religious and Cultural Services." The vision is stated in the first mission, namely "Realizing City Tourism Management that is Advanced, Religious, Orderly, and Cultured."

As a result of this objective, the Tourism and Culture Department is responsible for building and improving physical and non-physical infrastructure facilities to promote Pariaman City

tourism, attracting foreign and domestic visitors.

The West Sumatra Province Government Regulation, which issues Governor Regulation Number 32 of 2016 on the Integrated Movement as a guideline for each regency/city to develop tourism, also guides the establishment of this program.

This Governor Regulation refers to Law Number 23 of 2014 on Regional Government, which explains in article 12 paragraph (3) related to selected government affairs, such as tourism. It also refers to Law Number 10 of 2009 on Tourism and Government Regulation Number 50 of 2011 on Master Planning for National Tourism Development or RIPPARNAS and RIPPARDA 2010-2025.

The legalistic basis is part of public policy, which is good when implemented properly after mutually agreeing. Without implementation, the policy is nothing more than a pipe dream and legal jargon. (Udoji Dalam Wahab, 2008). Public policy consists of government actions and decisions to solve people's problems and improve their standard of living (Gil-Garcia, Pardo, & Luna-Reyes, 2018); therefore, it is a solution to public problems.

The Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program is one form of policy taken in increasing competitiveness and tourism potential in Pariaman City to improve the economy as contained in the strategic planning of the Tourism and Culture Department.

A study by (Wu, Ramesh, & Howlett, 2018) stated that public policy results from political government activities. According to (Hague, Harrop, & McCormick, 2019), public policy is

concerned with the outcome of the political process; the core purpose of government is to manage and fulfill the needs of society. Therefore, the approaches adopted and actions taken (or avoided) collectively constitute the policy.

Once established, the public policy should be implemented to achieve its objectives. Policy implementation is one of the most challenging aspects of the policy process (Birkland, 2015). It is conducted when the policy vision is brought into the real world (Gil-Garcia et al., 2018). Therefore, this study analyzes the policy implementation process from productivity, linearity, and efficiency (Hamdi, 2014).

A. Productivity

Productivity is related to realizing the achievement of predetermined standards. The smoother the achievement of these standards, the more influential the implementation (Hamdi, 2014). The extent to which a program or policy can fulfill the goals and targets specified is examined in this topic. This program aims to strengthen the tourism sector's role in the economy based on-field results. Several target groups have noticed a rise, including increased tourist visits, length of stay, and cultural preservation. The standard achievement of the number of target groups can be seen in table 4.

Table 4. Achievement of the Goals and Targets of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach Tourism Destination Development Program in 2018-2020

Target	Program Achievement (In %)		
	2018	2019	2020
Number of Tourist Visits	4,0/4,0	3,85/3,85	3,0/3,0
Length of stay	1/0,5	1/1	1/1
Cultural Preservation	1/1	2/2	1/1

Source: Processed by researchers from the Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2020

Table 4 shows the achievements of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program from 2018 to 2020. The number of tourists who visited surpassed 100 percent, with 817 people and 3,431,670 people visiting in 2018, 1,230 people and 3,801,770 people visiting in 2019, and 258 people and 3,925,086 people visiting in 2020, respectively. Furthermore, the length of stay reached 50% of the target set at 0.5 days in 2018. In 2019 and 2020, it reached 100% of 1 day. Meanwhile, the number of local cultures developed was 1 (Tabuik) in 2018, 2 (Tabuik and Ulu Ambek) in 2019, and 1 (Ulu Ambek) in 2020.

This shows that the number of tourist visits as presented in table 1 has increased in the last five years.

B. Linearity

Linearity relates to the conformity of the standard fulfillment process with the specified standard specification guidelines regarding procedures, time, cost, place, and implementers (Hamdi, 2014).

Regarding procedures, implementing the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development

program in Pariaman City has predetermined procedures. The Tourism and Culture Department created this program, whose procedures and implementation are contained in the 2018-2023 Strategic Plan. The implementation of this strategic plan is also guided by the Vision and Mission of the elected Pariaman Mayor in 2018-2023 and is one flagship program of Pariaman City.

The growth of tourism, industry, trade, cooperatives, MSMEs, and increased investment is among the regional development priorities mentioned in the Pariaman City Medium-Term Development Plan 2018-2023, also directed by the West Sumatra Province Medium-Term Development Plan 2016-2021. Furthermore, in Governor Regulation Number 32 of 2016 on the Integrated Movement for West Sumatra Province Tourism Development, the purpose and objectives of tourism development are also regulated. As stated in Article 2, tourism development aims to create synergy in the regions with planned, integrated, and sustainable implementation.

Regarding time and cost, the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program is planned to achieve the goal of being a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area. The achievement is financed from the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget and the Special Allocation Fund of Pariaman City annually. Therefore, the activities of this program are carried out at the time specified in the fiscal year created.

Table 6. Budget for the Implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach Tourism Destination Development Program for 2018-2022

No	Fiscal year	Number	Realization
1	2018	1.832.000.000	100%
2	2019	1.608.000.000	100%
3	2020	4.021.250.000	100%
4	2021	1.360.000.000	In process
5	2022	7.515.000.000	Not yet

Source: Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2020

Regarding the condition, place, position, and area, the destinations built in this program are near the coast. This is based on the Terms of Reference (KA) for the 2019 Gandoriah-Sunur Beach strategic area development plan, which was built on 170 hectares. This land use can be seen in table 7.

Table 7. Land Use in the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach Strategic Area

No	Land Use	Location Area (Ha)
1	Playground	0,56
2	Naval Struggle Monument	0,37
3	Gandoriah Pavilion	0,63
4	Dock	0,25
5	Asean Monument	0,78
6	Kata Beach Park	2,45
7	Fish Monument	0,34
8	Swing Park	0,41
9	Futsal field	0,51
10	Skate Park (Cermin Beach Park)	0,88
11	Anas Malik Park	1,77
12	Sport Centre	1,54
13	Open Area	148,20
14	Motor cross	5,81
15	Anas Malik Park Development	0,60
16	Kata Beach Food Court	0,18

<https://doi.org/10.33701/jtp.v13i2.1934>

No	Land Use	Location Area (Ha)
17	Kata Beach Park Development	1,50
18	Cermin Beach Park Development	0,80
19	Marine Pier	0,72
20	Rest Area	1,70
	Total	170,00

Source: Public Works and Spatial Planning and Land Department, 2019

Based on table 7, it can be concluded that the estimation of strategic place has been carried out carefully by considering the structure of the land owned.

Regarding the implementers, the implementers, in this case, are the City/Regency government, related agencies, and the private sector. Therefore, implementing this tourism destination development program involves the government and the private sector.

Table 8. Stakeholders related to the Gandorhah-Sunur Beach Tourism Destination Development Program

No	Activity	Implementer
1	Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure	Tourism and Culture Department
2	Procurement of Facilities and Infrastructure	Consultant
3	Development and Provision of Facilities and Infrastructure	Public Works and Public Housing Department
4	Security	Civil service police unit
5	Cleanliness of Tourism Destinations	Environmental Department

No	Activity	Implementer
6	Coordination and Channeling Aspiration	Village head
7	Coordination and Giving Aspiration	Community/Youth Organization/ <i>Ninik Mamak</i>

Source: Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2020

The table above classifies the implementation activities of the Gandorhah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program based on the responsible Regional Apparatus Work Units, which have been assessed as linear.

C. Efficiency

Efficiency is related to the ability to utilize resources in policy implementation. These resources can be personnel, assets, funds, and technology, where the more minimal use to achieve goals, the more efficient the policy implementation (Hamdi, 2014).

Regarding personnel, the implementation of the Gandorhah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program is conducted by various parties following their respective duties and functions. Therefore, there is a slight possibility of power abuse. In implementing this program, many personnel are involved, both from the Tourism and Culture Department and other Regional Apparatus Work Units in Pariaman City according to their respective duties and functions.

The funds for this implementation are adjusted to the predetermined annual budget. In reality, this budgeting

is experiencing a bit of a constraint due to the Covid-19 pandemic. According to the interview, the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program usually operated prior to the Covid-19 pandemic. Therefore, the funds allocated are consistent with the activities' realization. However, during the 2020 pandemic, the previously set budget was almost completely cut in the 2020 fiscal year.

This budget cut causes several activities previously planned and budgeted for the implementation of the tourism destination development program to be abolished. However, some activities continue to be carried out by reducing the previous budget. As a result, the activities of the tourism destination development program underwent slight changes, including the funds or budgets that had been set. The changes affect the program's success due to budget cuts and the elimination of several activities. Table 9 shows the changes and outcomes of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program activities in 2020.

Table 9. Realization of Gandoriah-Sunur Beach Tourism Destination Development Program Activities in 2020

Name of Activity	Initial Budget (Million)	Changed Budget (Million)	Description
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Gandoriah Beach Area	110	110	Constant

Name of Activity	Initial Budget (Million)	Changed Budget (Million)	Description
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Kata Beach Area	19	19	Constant
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Lohong Beach Area	90	90	Cut
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Mangrove Forest Area	110	55	Cut
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in the Navy Monument Area	40	40	Constant
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Angso Duo Island Area	169	169	Constant
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in Tabuik Pasa and Subarang House Areas	90	90	Constant
Maintenance of Facilities and Infrastructure in the Monument and Gate Area	20	-	Abolished

Name of Activity	Initial Budget (Million)	Changed Budget (Million)	Description
Shopping for Planning Consulting Services	14	13.933	Cut
Shopping for Supervision Consulting Services	10	-	Abolished
Construction of Tourism WC/Toilet	176.	175.66	Cut

Source: Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, 2021

Even though some activity funds have been slashed or eliminated, the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program may still run smoothly, as shown in the table above.

The technology used in implementing this tourism destination development program is adjusted to the technology owned by the person in charge of each activity. Therefore, utilizing technology that facilitates and accelerates the development and maintenance process of tourism destination areas in implementing this tourism destination development program is appropriate and efficient. Based on observations, the use of this technology is based on equipment owned by workers and contractors/ CVs in carrying out the construction and development of planned tourism destinations based on the existing technical guidelines.

These resources can be in the form of personnel, assets, funds, and technology. The more minimal use of implementers, assets, and funds, and the more precise the use of technology

to achieve goals, the more efficient the policy implementation (Hamdi, 2014). Based on the analysis, the implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program has not been efficient in using resources, especially from the funds used for the construction and development of planned tourism destination facilities and infrastructure. This inefficiency is due to the Covid-19 pandemic, resulting in budget cuts and eliminating several previously determined activities.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the implementation of the Gandoriah-Sunur Beach tourism destination development program as a Pariaman City Tourism Strategic Area (KSPK) is not yet fully optimal as seen from the non-linearity of standards with costs and the inefficient allocation of funds for program implementation. Therefore, this study suggests that cost linearity and efficiency be optimized, as well as good planning, to ensure that no program activities be missed.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors are grateful to the Pariaman City Tourism and Culture Department, informants from businesses and the community, and all parties who contribute to this research.

REFERENCES

1. Bahiyah, C., Riyanto, W. H., & Sudarti, S. (2018). Strategi Pengembangan Potensi Pariwisata di Pantai Duta Kabupaten Probolinggo. *Jurnal Ilmu Ekonomi*

<https://doi.org/10.33701/jtp.v13i2.1934>

- JIE*, 2(1), 95–103.
<https://ejournal.umm.ac.id/index.php/jie/article/view/6970>
2. Bashiru, L., Fattah, M. H., & Kasnir, M. (2019). Strategi pengembangan wisata bahari di Kecamatan Betoambari Kota Bau-Bau. *JOINT-FISH - Jurnal Akuakultur, Teknologi Dan Manajemen Perikanan Tangkap, Ilmu Kelautan*, 2(2), 148–160.
<https://doi.org/10.33096/joint-fish.v2i2.48>
 3. Birkland, T. A. (2015). *An Introduction to the policy process: Theories, concepts, and models of public policy making* (Vol. 1). New York: Routledge.
 4. Creatoracademy.youtube.com. (2020). Dasar-dasar YouTube.
 5. Demolingo, R. H. (2015). Strategi Pengembangan Destinasi Wisata Desa Bongo, Kabupaten Gorontalo. *Jumpa*, 1(2), 67–82.
<https://doi.org/10.24843/JUMPA.2015.v01.i02.p06>
 6. Gil-Garcia, J. R., Pardo, T. A., & Luna-Reyes, L. F. (Eds.). (2018). *Policy analytics, modelling, and informatics: Innovative tools for solving complex social problems*.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-61762-6_19
 7. Hadi, F., & Ari, M. K. H. al-A. (2017). Kajian Potensi dan Strategi Pengembangan Wisata Pantai Syari'ah (Studi di Pulau Santen Kabupaten Banyuwangi). *Jurnal Md*, 3(1), 99–116.
<https://doi.org/10.14421/jmd.2017.31-07>
 8. Hague, R., Harrop, M., & McCormick, J. (2019). *Comparative government and politics: an introduction* (11th ed.). London: Red Globe Press.
 9. Hamdi, M. (2014). *Kebijakan publik: Proses, analisis, dan partisipasi*. Bogor: Ghalia Indonesia.
 10. Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (third). USA: Sage.
 11. Nasional, K. (2019). *Sepanjang 2019, devisa sektor pariwisata mencapai Rp 280 triliun*.
 12. Sabri, A. (2015). Analisis Strategi Pengembangan Objek Wisata Danau Bandar Kayangan di Kota Pekanbaru. *Jurnal Daya Saing*, 1(1), 1–13.
<https://doi.org/10.35446/dayasaing.v1i1.1>
 13. Samimi. (2011). Tourism and Economic Growth in Developing Countries: P-VAR Approach. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 10(1), 28–32.
[https://idosi.org/mejsr/mejsr10\(1\)11/5.pdf](https://idosi.org/mejsr/mejsr10(1)11/5.pdf)
 14. Wahab, S. A. (2008). *Analisis Kebijakan: Dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijakan Negara* (kedua). Jakarta: bumi aksara.
 15. Winia, I. N., Ginaya, G., Mudana, I. G., & Widana, I. P. K. A. (2019). Best practice of green rural tourism: lesson from Sangkan Gunung, Karangasem. *International Journal of Green Tourism Research and Applications*, 1(1), 21–33.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.31940/ijogtra.v1i1.1628>
 16. World Travel and Tourism Council. (2019). Travel and Tourism: World Economic Impact 2019. *Current*
<https://doi.org/10.33701/jtp.v13i2.1934>

Issues in Tourism.

<https://doi.org/10.2167/cit/mp004>

.0

17. Wu, X., Ramesh, M., & Howlett, M. (Eds.). (2018). *Policy capacity and governance: Assessing governmental competences and capabilities in theory and practice.* https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-54675-9_1
18. Yakup, A. P. (2019). Pengaruh Pariwisata Terhadap Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Kepariwisata Indonesia*, 6(2), 1–89.
19. Yuliviona, R. (2020). *Sumber Manajemen Ekonomi.* Padang: Universitas Bung Hatta.
20. Yuspi, I Nengah, T., & Jonny, W. (2021). *Pengembangan Kawasan Wisata Tepi Air-Studi Kasus: Pantai Gandorah Pariaman.* Universitas Bung Hatta.