

Development Of Apparatus Competency In The Tourism And Cultural Department Of Trenggalek Regency

Adelia Amanda¹, Gradiana Tefa^{*2}

¹Regional Development Planning Agency of East Java Province,
adeliamanda15@gmail.com

²Institute of Home Affairs Governance, gradiana_tefa@ipdn.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The development of the globalization era requires human resources to develop and improve their potential and performance ability. This indicates the requirement of an apparatus, which has good competency to carry out authority. Trenggalek Regency is one of the Indonesian areas having amazing tourism potential, where a good competent apparatus is needed to manage and develop the tourism sector. Therefore, this study aims to determine and analyze the apparatus competency development of the Tourism and Culture Department in Trenggalek Regency, Indonesia. It also aims to determine the related inhibiting factors and the efforts provided to overcome them. In this study, a qualitative-descriptive method and an inductive approach were used, with interviews, observation, and documentation implemented for data collection. Data analysis was also carried performed through parameter reduction, presentation, verification, and conclusions. Based on the results, the implementation of the apparatus competency development was adequately performed at the Tourism and Culture Office of Trenggalek Regency. Irrespective of these conditions, some challenges were still observed, regarding the budget available for the developmental processes and the apparatus' lack of interest in activity participation. To overcome these challenges, interpersonal collaboration and participation in apparatus webinars were part of the efforts performed by the Department of Tourism and Culture.

Keywords: Competency Development, Apparatus

Introduction

The apparatus resources development is the government's concern to realize good and professional governance in all fields. This shows that the development of apparatus competency and quality is one of the eight areas of change in bureaucratic reform. According to the Grand Design for State Civil Apparatus Development (2020-2024), bureaucratic reform demanded the development of SSCA (Smart State Civil Apparatus) with the HCM (Human Capital Management) strategy. This strategy realizes good governance in carrying out government and development tasks. Furthermore, one of these strategies is the State Civil Apparatus development, which is used to increase competency. Regarding the apparatus resources development, Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus Article 70, stated that every SCA (State Civil Apparatus) had

***Corresponding author**

Gradiana Tefa
Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri
gradiana_tefa@ipdn.ac.id
Phone: 082115097187

Received: August 12, 2022
Revised: September 11, 2022
Accepted: October 16, 2022
Available Online: December 5, 2022

the right and opportunity to develop competency through education and training, courses, seminars, and upgrading.

Trenggalek Regency has a lot of potential for natural beauty and is used as a tourist attraction in Indonesia. Based on previous data, 34 tourism objects in this area need to be managed and developed. The development of this attraction sector in Trenggalek Regency is also carried out by the Ministry of Tourism and Culture, whose formulation emphasized Regional Regulation Number 17 of 2016 concerning the Establishment and Composition of Apparatuses. Subsequently, the formulation focused on Regional Regulation Number 30 of 2017 concerning the elaboration of the Tourism and Culture Department duties. This department is a government agency in Trenggalek Regency, which organizes various affairs in the tourism and cultural fields. From this context, an apparatus with good competency is highly needed for appropriate management and development.

Table 1. Formal Education Levels of State Civil Apparatus at the Tourism and Culture Office of Trenggalek Regency in 2021

No	Education	Number of people	Percentage
1.	Master's Degree (S2)	1	3%
2.	Bachelor's Degree (S1)	20	52%
3.	Bachelor of Applied Sciences Degree (DIV)	1	3%
4.	Associate Degree (DIII)	1	3%
5.	Senior High School	15	39%
Total		38	100%

Source: Apparatus Management Information System of Trenggalek Regency, 2021

Based on Table 1, only 3%, 52%, and 39% of the Apparatuses had Master's, Bachelor's, and Non-bachelor degrees, respectively. This indicates that formal educational background often influences the apparatus in carrying out government duties, especially in the tourism sector. Besides this, the educational background should also be supported by other skills, knowledge, and expertise. Irrespective of these conditions, the Tourism and Culture Department apparatus of Trenggalek Regency has not appropriately considered the development of employees. This has reportedly been observed from the apparatus that have not obtained structural education and training, as well as functional tourism literacy. In addition, various challenges often affect the apparatus's competency, such as the lack of personnel resources and the absence of development programs due to budget re-focusing. This condition illustrates inadequate competency in the apparatus ability and skills of the Trenggalek Regency's Tourism and Culture Department. From this context, the implementation of government duties is often hampered.

To support the department's vision and mission, the capabilities and skills of the apparatus are needed in occupying specific positions. The non-optimal performance of the apparatus is also influenced by the lacking competency. Regarding the development potential of the Trenggalek Regency's tourism sector by the Regional Government, the apparatus at the T&C (Tourism and Culture) Department is expected to have appropriate competencies in supporting organizational performance. Therefore, this study aims to determine and describe: the apparatus competency development of the Tourism and Culture Department in Trenggalek Regency, Indonesia. It also aims to determine the various related inhibiting factors and the efforts provided to overcome them.

Based on these descriptions, the problem formulation to be evaluated emphasizes the following, (1) The development patterns of the apparatus competency, (2) The inhibiting factors for developing the competency, and (3) The efforts provided in overcoming the factors.

Human Resource Management

According to Stooner and Freeman (1992) in Rodiyah & Agustina (2020:6), management contained planning, organizing, leading and controlling employees, as well as using organizational resources for goal achievements. This indicates that HRM (Human Resource Management) is an art and science effectively and efficiently regulating employees' relationships and roles, to achieve company and community goals (Hasibuan, 2019:10).

Development

Based on Hasibuan (2019), development was used to improve the employees' technical, theoretical, conceptual, and moral abilities. In this context, transfers are also useful for employees' development, due to their aims to increase organizational efficiency, effectiveness, and work productivity. Moreover, Andrew E Sikula (2001) in Priansa (2018:147) stated that HR development was guided by the interests of employees in the organization. This showed that development was a long-term process, which uses systematic and organized stages. Based on these theories, the development of apparatus resources emphasizes the increase of knowledge, skills, attitudes, and behaviour, to carry out responsibilities. This leads to the effective and efficient performance of employees through a systematic and organized process, using education, training, and transfers to support the organizational goals.

Scope of Apparatus Development

The scope of apparatus development prioritizes various patterns toward goal achievement. According to Hasibuan (2019:69,102), apparatus development was carried out through education, training, and transfers. This is because development is a gradual process having comprehensive

and continuous characteristics. In this process, education and training play very important roles in increasing individual knowledge and expertise, respectively. Meanwhile, transfers often provided the apparatus with more opportunities to seek work experience.

Apparatus Development Through Education

Based on Flippo in Hasibuan (2019:69-70), *Education emphasized the elevation of general knowledge and understanding, regarding the entire environment. Meanwhile, training focused on increasing the knowledge and skill of an employee when performing a specific job.* This perception prioritizes the development toward the achievement of organizational goals. Although education and training are related, some differences are still observed, regarding the exhibited theoretical and practical features, respectively.

Bella in Hasibuan (2019: 70) also suggested that Education and Training were the developments aiming to technically and managerially improve the ability to work. In this case, education highly emphasized classroom theory, long duration, and the answer to the questions of "why". Meanwhile, training focused more on practicals, which were often performed briefly in the field. It also considered the answers to the question of "how". Based on these concepts, Hasibuan (2019: 70-71) stated that the development of apparatus education essentially focused on Conceptual, Career, and Moral purposes.

These previous reports proved that apparatus development prioritized mastering theories through education, according to the concepts being supported and applied in job assignments. Furthermore, education supports the employees' potential in carrying out duties. It is also provided to increase the employees' morale, indicating that higher education leads to very good morale. This specific moral emphasizes the patterns by which employees overcome all organizational problems. In this case, attitudinal ethics and obedience are often needed to comply with existing regulations.

Apparatus Development through Training

According to Wibowo (2017:442), training and skill development was the organizational assets playing an important role in human resources. This focused on the development of knowledge and skills in supporting work. After several theories are obtained, training is often needed by the apparatus, to solve existing problems and jobs. It also has a short-term goal orientation for the achievement of job duties and future requirement preparation.

This was in line with Andrew Sikul in Hasibuan (2019: 70), where training was a short-term educational process, which used structured and systematic procedures in knowledge and

technical skills learning. It was also carried out with limited goals by non-managerial employees. In this case, training is very important for the apparatus, to increase capacity and quality, even in a short time.

Hasibuan (2019:76) also showed that the goals in developing employees are as follows, (1) Developing technical skills, such as job completion, and (2) Developing managerial skills, such as leadership and decision-making. Regarding these perspectives, training is observed as the method of developing apparatus, to improve technical, leadership, and decision-making skills.

Apparatus Development Through Employee Transfer

Hasibuan (2019:102) argued that "Transfers were part of the apparatus development functions increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of organizational performance". This explained that transfers had benefits when applying basic principles, such as the placement of apparatus in their appropriate positions (the man in the right place/job). Therefore, employee transfers are the development used to increase work effectiveness and efficiency, to produce better output. They also indicate the movement of the apparatus to another agency or an organization occupying an equal or higher position. This is generally carried out regarding increased work productivity, experience or problems.

Based on Hasibuan (2019:103), a total of 3 (three) foundations were arguably observed for implementing employee transfers, namely

a. *System merit*

Employee transfers based on scientific, objective and work performance results.

b. *Seniority system*

Transfers prioritizing the employee's tenure, age, and work experience. This is not objective because the skills of the superior person transferred are not necessarily able to hold positions;

c. *Spoil system*

The transfers emphasizing family relationships, which is bad due to the focus on interest and disinterest.

In Hasibuan (2019:103), the concept of the merit or career system was good based on the following,

1. Increased work productivity
2. Increased work enthusiasm
3. Decreased errors in carrying out tasks

Irrespective of the several positivities of the seniority and spoil systems, the merit platform is still used as a reference for employee transfers.

Competency

According to Spencer (1993) in Sedarmayanti (2017:21), "*Competency was an underlying characteristic of an individual, which is casually related to the effective and/or superior performance in a job or situation*". This indicated that competency was a personality existing in various individuals, which was effectively adopted toward organizational performance. It also argued that five competency characteristics were exhibited, including,

1. Motives
2. Traits
3. Self-concept
4. Knowledge
5. Skills

Method

A qualitative design was used with descriptive methods and inductive approaches in this analysis. This emphasized the description of the real situation based on the study location data. For the inductive approach, the main characteristics contained general information, which was obtained from in-depth interviews.

According to Sugiyono (2017:9), "qualitative methods emphasized postpositivism or interpretive philosophy, which were useful in the experimental performance of natural object conditions. Furthermore, data collection was carried out through triangulation, which is the combination of observation, interviews, and documentation. This was accompanied by the analysis of the data obtained, which were inductive/qualitative. The results also prioritized analytical interpretation and uniqueness, as well as the construction and determination of various phenomena and hypotheses, respectively. This indicated that qualitative analysis was directly related to the data sources, with the study expert functioning as the main key in the processing stage. The data obtained from the observations and interviews with the participants were also graphically or orthographically represented and did not only emphasize numbers.

Based on Sudaryono (2018: 91), "qualitative methods were used to analyze public life, by depicting the social world from the perceptions or interpretations of informants in a natural setting". This proved that the methods were used to understand the perceptions and

interpretations of the participants, regarding the description of their social nature. Sugiyono (2017:224) also stated that "data collection techniques were strategically used to obtain analytical information". This focused on the use of interviews, observations, and documentation to obtain appropriate data.

1. Semi-Structured Interview

Direct semi-structured interviews were carried out at the location of the participants, with the main questions inadvertently asked. However, the questions increased when the required information remained insufficient. According to Esterberg (2002) in Sugiyono (2017:233), these interviews were included in the in-depth category, to openly and highly determine problems, as well as instruct participants to express their opinions.

2. Observation

Marshall in Sugiyono (2017:226) stated that *"behaviours and related intentions were understood through observation"*. According to Spradley in Sugiyono (2017:229), observation contained the following components,

1. Locations, where interactions in social situations are performed.
2. Actors, people playing specific roles.
3. Activities, which are carried out by actors in ongoing social situations.

This showed that qualitative data were obtained from the work process, human behaviour, and field phenomena, through observation.

3. Documentation

Based on Sugiyono (2017: 240), documentation was "a record of past events, in the form of writing, pictures or monumental works". This is often used to support analytical data and is observed in books, newspapers, magazines, and related regulations.

In this analysis, most of the field data were visually or soundly derived as photos, objects, or public documents, such as letters, newspapers, and magazines. These are mostly obtained directly or indirectly from the field. Data analysis was also carried out through various techniques, namely reduction, presentation, verification, and conclusions. In this experiment, the technical analytical model of Miles & Huberman (1984) in Sugiyono (2017:246-252) was used and shown as follows,

a. Data Reduction

Since the data obtained in the field were quite much, a cautious and comprehensive analysis was very necessary. Data reduction is the process of selecting, summarizing, simplifying, and emphasizing important analytical phenomena. This is often guided by various achievable objectives.

b. Data Display

The reduced data are commonly presented in brief descriptions, charts, categorical relationships, or flowcharts.

c. Drawing Conclusion

Conclusions are often developed regarding the information obtained after data reduction and presentation. In drawing conclusions, the data obtained are frequently presented in clear statements, for a better understanding of the indicators being studied.

Based on these descriptions, data reduction and display, as well as drawing conclusions were used in this study. This emphasized the summarization and presentation of data in brief explanations, charts, and texts. It also focused on the final description of an object, regarding the data obtained.

Result and Discussion

Competency Development of Apparatus Resources at the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency

1. Development Through Education

Based on Article 70 of Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning SCA (State Civil Apparatus), the apparatus had the right to develop its competency through educational activities. Education programs were also provided to those in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency, to develop their competencies.

Table 2. The Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency Apparatus Participating in the 2020-2021 Education Program

Participant	Year		Total
	2020	2021	
Study Task	-	-	-
Study Permit	2	-	2

Source: Trenggalek Regency Tourism and Culture Department, 2022

Based on Table 2, the development program through the study task and permit was not optimally performed, because only a few employees participated in the educative system. Besides this, some apparatus also occupied positions that were unrelated to their educational background. For example, the General and Civil Service Sub-section Head had a law degree, with the finance personnel having an English literature background. In this case, the education, to a higher level, should be adjusted to the position. This was due to the importance of the educational background to the production of good work results. Therefore, a person whose educational background aligns with a work position is specifically different from those with misplaced priorities. This was in line with the challenges of the tourism sector, where an individual with a higher education and attraction background merited the possession of different concepts of thought, morals, and motivation. Development is also specifically expected through formal education, to improve the theoretical and moral abilities of the apparatus.

A. Conceptual

The mastery of theory or conceptual abilities is often comprehensively prepared and carefully planned. This has a strong theoretical basis, clear background and goals, as well as a good plan and benefits. It is also the basis for the apparatus to develop every thought and ability, regarding the performance of all tasks from superiors.

- **Mastery of Theory**

Based on the interviews with the Head and the Secretary of the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency, the conceptual abilities of the apparatus were good, although they lacked attraction management. These good abilities were due to their possession of a higher educational level. This indicated the necessity to improve the implementation of education for the apparatus, to increase mastery of the theory. In this case, the field data, especially in tourism, were still not good.

From the observations, the explanations of the apparatus were adequately performed when provided with a scientific question. They also provided answers based on their discipline's perceptions when asked a tourism question. This proved that the apparatus mastery of theory in the field, especially tourism, was still not good. In this case, the performance of training is highly necessary to strengthen skills and implement good theoretical mastery.

B. Career

Careers are the series of jobs and positions that have been occupied by people during their working periods. These show the employees' improvement and development during their organizational tenure.

- **Opportunity to attend education.**

Based on observations at the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency, opportunities were very open for the apparatus to participate in higher-level educational programs, which are futuristically useful for career development. However, the willingness was reduced due to the difficulties encountered when participating in educational programs. In this case, a huge amount of time and money was consumed.

The Covid-19 pandemic also reduced the willingness of the apparatus to participate in educational programs, regarding the health measures implemented during this period. Moreover, the income earned by the apparatus in the Trenggalek Regency was reduced, leading to a decrease in learning program participation. Although several opportunities were provided, employees still had low awareness and interest to participate in the study permit and task programs.

C. Apparatus Morale

According to Hasibuan (2019:69), "education improved the theoretical, conceptual, and moral skills of employees". It was also the major factor affecting the apparatus morales. This showed that high education was directly proportional to the apparatus's moral level in obeying superiors' orders. In Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning SCA (State Civil Apparatus), Article 69, Paragraph 2 stated that the career development of civil servants was carried out by considering integrity and morality. This confirmed that morale influenced the career development of these employees in carrying out their duties.

Regarding the observations, the apparatus in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency had good loyalty to their superiors and co-workers. This showed that the tasks assigned by superiors to subordinates were appropriately carried out and completed, with every order immediately implemented. The Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency was also always available at the office during working hours, irrespective of the attached circumstances.

Based on the interviews, the work ethics of the apparatus were shaped by the job environment and their habits. When this environment is good/bad with high/low integrity, an appropriate/inappropriate performance is often observed. Ethics did not also depend on the high or low educational level adopted by the apparatus, due to being established from the organizational environment and work culture.

The results also showed that the apparatus in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency had multiple similar opportunities to develop their abilities through education

to a higher level. The participants of competency development in the educational field also showed an increase in conceptual and theoretical abilities. This was specifically necessary, considering the management of attraction by the Tourism and Culture Department. In this case, a shortage of apparatus was still observed with a tourism background. The perspective of people with this background also differed from those with other foundations when perceiving situations, phenomena, and problems in the tourism sector. Furthermore, the apparatus with a tourism background was specifically more critical, complex, and effective. They also had many innovations in solving tourism problems.

Irrespective of these conditions, education was not one of the factors affecting the attitude or morale of the apparatus, regarding loyalty and social ethics. However, the environment or work culture strongly influenced their morale. This indicated that education was unable to show an increase in the morale of the apparatus.

2. Apparatus Competency Development Through Training

Andrew Sikula in Hasibuan (2019: 69) defined "training as a short-term educational process, using a systematic procedure. In this process, non-managerial employees learned technical knowledge and skills for limited purposes." This indicated that training was very important in the development of personnel resources, to ensure work ability even when orientation was only for a short time. These results were in line with Hasibuan (2019: 69), where "training improved the technical skills of employees' job performance". The process was also carried out to reduce the gap between abilities and the task demands of the apparatus, regarding technical and managerial matters. In addition, tasks are often completed by knowledgeable and experienced apparatus within specific fields.

A. Improvement of Technical Skills

Table 3. Technical Training for Apparatus in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency in 2021

Training Type	Training Name	Implementation time	Number of participants
Technical Training	Training on computer-based procurement of goods	20 to 23 October 2021	1 person
	Training on the use of e-performance applications	6 to 17 March 2021	1 person

Source: Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency, 2022

Based on Table 3, the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency only attended two technical training in 2021, with only two apparatus participating. For a local government, this value was specifically very small in one year.

In the implementation of training, the apparatus competency development program at the Tourism and Culture Department was not optimally carried out. This was due to the budget constraints in developing and implementing the program. Subsequently, this department did not participate in tourism training, leading to the need for an optimal solution. This is based on the ability of the program to produce good technical skills, which are useful in completing related tasks. In this case, these skills are found to be influential to the ability level of the apparatus.

B. Managerial Skills Improvement

Managerial skills are the ability to organize, coordinate, and direct subordinates toward organizational goal achievement. These skills are commonly developed from a gradual process, through observation and learning.

According to field observations, the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency did not optimally implement the training program due to the Covid-19 pandemic. This indicated that only functional training was used to improve leadership. The results also showed an increase in the managerial skills of the apparatus that carried out leadership training. In this process, those that were able and unable to perform leadership training had differences in leading their field of work. However, the observed skills were obtained from training and several supporting elements, such as experience and tenure. Managerial training also increased and effectively affected the employees in carrying out their duties, especially those occupying specific positions. This subsequently led to the appropriate organizational treatment of the subordinates.

3. Competency Development Through Transfers

Based on Hasibuan (2019:102), "transfers were included in the employee development function due to increasing work efficiency and effectiveness within the organization". The implementation of this variable was also included to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of performance, as well as relocate resources to overcome internal and external challenges. Therefore, the flexibility of resources was realized as a key to organizational success. Transfers were also more useful when applying the principle of the suitable man in the appropriate place/job. This indicated the placement of the apparatus in a position suitable for the expertise possessed.

From the results, the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency had employee transfers. This showed that a total of two employees from other agencies were transferred to join the department in 2021. This specifically influenced the employees toward increasing their abilities and agencies, to refresh and colour the existing work environment with the experience previously possessed. In this case, those transferred need to quickly adapt to their new field of work.

System Merit

Transfers are part of apparatus development, with the present implementation emphasizing Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the SCA (State Civil Apparatus). This shows that transfers often implement a merit system as policy and management of the State Civil Apparatus, regarding the fair application of qualifications, competencies, and performance. From this context, productivity level, as well as work spirit and error rate are used as referential aspects for an organizational application. Furthermore, the productivity of apparatus performance becomes a reference for the leader in determining the transfers of employees with good or bad performance. This shows that the apparatus should be able to adapt when they are transferred.

Work spirit is also one of the benchmarks for consideration in carrying out mutations. In this case, the good spirit of the apparatus is often observed in their job performance, subsequently becoming an appropriate assessment from the leader. These conditions often led to the acquisition of promotions. Errors at work are one of the elements considered by the leader in transferring their employees, regarding demotion or promotion. This element should be minimally maintained within an organization, as continuous occurrences are very detrimental. After being transferred, the error rate at work commonly depends on the personal ability to understand the tasks provided by the leader. However, it is only natural as an adjustment to working in a new agency. Based on these descriptions, the newly transferred employees need to adequately prepare themselves to confront a different work environment and culture. These conditions showed that the employee transfers carried out on a merit system have not been appropriately applied. This was because the implementation was not completely complying with the principle of the appropriate man in the suitable position. These conditions emphasized a mismatch between educational background and the position occupied.

Inhibiting Factors Affecting Apparatus Competency Development in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency

Based on the results, the apparatus competency development in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency had some inhibiting factors, such as inadequate motivation to participate in the establishment program. This challenge occurred due to the unusability of development to improve the quality of employees, although was a formal requirement to occupy an existing position. Furthermore, the retirement of the elderly was assumed a channel for participation to be debunked in employee development. Some employees also feel guilty for leaving their positions to carry out the study task program. Another challenge prioritized the decrease of budget availability for development program participation, due to re-focusing. This specific challenge is widely experienced by several locations, especially the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency. In this case, the budgeted and planned education and training programs were unable to be implemented.

Efforts Provided to Overcome the Inhibiting Factors Affecting Apparatus Competency Development in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency

Collaboration with third parties such as universities and external tourist attractions is one of the efforts provided to support competency development in the T&C (Tourism and Culture) Department of Trenggalek Regency. Another provided effort is the effective and efficient participation in webinars, for apparatus to increase knowledge. This is specifically effective in the apparatus competency development during the Covid-19 pandemic. It also enables easier acquisition of knowledge, considering the present unavailability of budget for competency development implementation.

Conclusion

Based on these results, the following conclusions were provided,

1. The apparatus competency development in the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency was severally carried out. Firstly, education and training were quite good by providing opportunities for study tasks and permits, although implementation was constrained due to the lack of motivation and limited participation chances. These constraints emphasized some detrimental sources, such as budget re-focusing to meet the needs of the apparatus. Secondly, employee transfers were carried out on a merit system, although they were not appropriately implemented due to incomplete compliance with the principle of a

- suitable man in an adequate position. This was due to a mismatch between educational background and the position occupied.
2. The apparatus competency development had some inhibiting factors, namely (a) The lack of employee motivation to participate in the development program, and (b) The reduced budget to participate in the development program due to re-focusing.
 3. The efforts provided by the Tourism and Culture Department of Trenggalek Regency in developing the apparatus competency included (a) Collaboration with third parties such as universities and external tourist attractions having effective outbound activities, and (b) Adequate participation in webinars to increase knowledge.

Reference

- Creswell, J.W. 2017. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. California: SAGE Publications.
- Hasibuan, Malayu S. P. 2019. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Priansa, D. J. 2018. *Perencanaan dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Rodiyah, I., & Agustina, I. F. 2020. *MSDM Sektor public*. Sidoarjo: UMSIDA Press.
- Sedarmayanti. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Reformasi Birokrasi dan Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Sudaryono. 2018. *Metodologi Penelitian*. Depok: PT. Rajagrafindo Persada.
- Sugiyono. 2017. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Wibowo. 2017. *Manajemen Kinerja – Edisi Ketiga*. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara.
- Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah.
- Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Trenggalek Nomor 17 Tahun 2016 tentang Pembentukan dan Susunan Perangkat Daerah.