

Implementation Of Public Transportation Policy In Bandung City: An Analysis Of Actors And Interests

Arif Moelia Edie

Ministry of Home Affairs, Jakarta, Indonesia

Email: arief_londo1002@yahoo.co.id

ABSTRACT

This study aims to analyze the policy of public transportation in Bandung City by highlighting the perspectives of actors and interests in policy implementation. Research method is qualitative, and data are collected from observation, interview and documentary study. It is found that the actors and interests affected from the policy can be classified into three main groups, namely: community as service users; drivers and public transport owners as operators; and local governments and DPRD as regulators. The main interest of the community is the creation of a cheap and convenient public transport system. The interests of the operators mainly include an improvement in tariff system as well as subsidy from the government. The regulators interests mainly include the creation of service standards as well as expectations to solve congestion problems as soon as possible. The main weak point of these interlinkage connections of actors and interests is that the regulator mainly focuses on the development of physical transportation facilities without being balanced with good regulations, especially regarding subsidies and route arrangements. The problem becomes increasingly complicated when there is political interest and maneuvers of local political actors.

Key words: Actor and Interest, Policy Implementation, Public Transportation

INTRODUCTION

The city of Bandung as the center of economic growth in West Java province requires an efficient transportation system to meet the mobility needs of the population. However, until now the local government is not able to facilitate public transportation services. According to data from the Ministry of Transportation, the city of Bandung is ranked third as the most traffic-prone city in Indonesia, after Jakarta and Bogor¹. The ratio of vehicle volume and road capacity in the city is 0.85, and the average speed of vehicles is only 14.3 km per hour. From 2000 to 2009, the average time needed to travel on the highway has increased from 30 minutes to 65 minutes. On holidays, on most arterial roads, vehicles can only move at an average speed of 5-15 km per hour. Furthermore, the entrance and exit of Bandung has experienced an average delay of 90 minutes (Pradono & Soegijanto, 2013).

The recent policy of public transportation management is *Perda 2/2008 on Penyelenggaraan Perhubungan*, *Perda 3/2008 on Penyelenggaraan Perparkiran*, and *Perda 16/2012 on Penyelenggaraan Perhubungan dan Retribusi di Bidang Perhubungan*. The regulations state that public transportation is a

unitary system consisting of mass transportation, traffic networks, traffic infrastructure, public vehicles and their drivers as well as the road users. The purpose of the policy is to create an integrated public transportation system that prioritizes safety to encourage the economy and the welfare of the community. The city government of Bandung has not been successful in implementing the policy. Congestion frequently exists due to the increase in number of private vehicles as well as people activities.

Theoretically, Hogwood and Gunn (1986) state that policy failure can be attributed to the unsupportive external conditions. They state that obstacles to implementation may be political and technical, thus measures are needed to overcome. Similarly, Grindle (1980) states that the success of policy implementation is determined not only by content but also context of policy. Stakeholders have various interests affected by the implementation, whether directly or indirectly. Every actor of policy has a tendency to gain benefits for himself. Thus, Grindle (1980) reminds that a policy needs to consider the strength or power, interests and strategies used by the actors involved in policy implementation. Without careful calculation of these contexts, it is very likely that the policy cannot gain the expected results. Grindle (1980) highlights that policy implementation will involve many interests. If all

¹<http://bisniskeuangan.kompas.com/read/2014/10/21/185600226/Ini.Tiga.Kota.Paling.Rawan.Macet.in.Indonesia>

interests are really taken into account and accommodated, then it is likely that a policy can be implemented successfully. However, Weaver (2009) finds that it is very difficult to make all parties comply with the policies taken. The tendency to maneuver will be even greater if stakeholders are not involved in policy formulation, if there is no interest meeting point between them, and if there are communication barriers that make stakeholders unable to understand all policy information.

Furthermore, the implementation of policy requires the existence of mutual interests, authority and mutually agreed transaction processes (O'Toole & Montjoy, 1984). As a process of persuasion, bargaining and cooperation, implementation will end when a consensus to form a coalition is formed. The coalition was formed by giving various concessions in return for the support provided. Those who are involved and become members of the coalition are not solely influenced by the expectations of benefits or benefits that can be obtained, but also by the anxiety of the exclusion of the benefits of the policy. In this context there will be many passive members who only expect benefits without contributing anything. The process of implementation in this sense, can be understood as an effort to build support in a positive sense. In this implementation phase various interests will compete with each other. Some policy implementations have the support of implementers, but some others may be challenged.

The opinions mentioned above are equally important to understand the importance of elements of actors and interests in policy implementation. This study aims to contribute to the theoretical discourses by explaining the policy of public transport management of Bandung city. Substantively, it will identify the actors of implementation, the interests within it, and the interlinkages among them that create dynamics of policy.

METHOD

A qualitative approach was applied in this study. Key informants are purposively selected, and then enlarged through snowballing technique. They are officers in *Dinas Perhubungan* of *Bandung City*, the operators and the users of public transportation.

Validity of the data is checked through triangulation techniques. Field-works are conducted in 2015

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Description of the Policy

The scope and main content of Perda 16/2012 include the following items:

1. Arrangement of public transport is carried out with traffic management to ensure the security and safety of road transport (articles 37-44);
2. Traffic management is carried out by taking into account the comparison of traffic volume with road capacity, network availability and public transport services, and by limiting vehicle traffic and roadside parking spaces (article 48).
3. Public transport operators must meet minimum service standards which cover elements of security, order, safety, affordability and equality (article 95)
4. City Mayor is obliged to plan the transportation service requirements specified in the route network (Article 96).
5. Determination of route network is the result of survey taking into account the spatial layout, the Master Plan for Traffic and Road Transportation Networks, the demand for transportation services, the origin and destination of travel, the availability of network traffic and road transportation, the type of service and prototype vehicles (Article 97).
6. Every public transport operator must have a permit from the Regional Government carried out through selection and/ or auction in accordance with the provisions of the legislation (Articles 111-112)
7. Passenger transportation rates are determined by a Mayor's Decree taking into account mileage calculations (article 125)
8. In order to guarantee traffic safety and road transportation, community empowerment can be done through giving direction, guidance, counseling, training and technical assistance (article 41).
9. The Mayor controls and supervise sanctions for those violating the Perda (articles 126-131)

2. Actors and interests

In connection with the policy of public transportation in the city of Bandung, the actors and interests affected can be classified into three main groups, namely: community as service users; drivers and public transport owners as operators; and local governments and DPRD as regulators.

a. Community: the Users

Principally, the interests of the community are service convenience, certainty of departure schedules, and cheap transportation rates.

The results of interviews with informants from the community users of public transport services stated as follows:

"What we really need is actually a comfortable, but not luxurious, transportation that schedules and arrives at the destination can be predicted with certainty. However, we also want transportation fares that are affordable for our income²".

Various efforts to improve the supply have actually begun, such as the construction of the outer ring road, the operation of the Trans metro Bandung and the planned expansion of "the four in one". To design the future of transportation systems in the city of Bandung within the framework of sustainable and competitively development, several action plans are tried out in a comprehensive macro framework. The main issue in the short term is how to limit the use of private vehicles and provide good, comfortable and conducive public transport. The most important medium-term agenda in controlling space is to maintain adequate space for the city environment. Whereas for the longer term, urban pricing policy such as progressive taxes, property taxes and land taxes must be developed to support and control land use that meets the principles of sustainable development. Efforts to improve the quality of public services are carried out through revamping the overall and integrated public service system to be legal umbrella for the implementation of sanctions. The aims are to make them have the force to fulfill certain standards in service public.

However, according to public perceptions, the realization of the implementation of the current

public transport arrangement policy has not accommodated their interests much. The results of interviews with one of the public transport users explained:

"Public transportation services in the city of Bandung are minimal, the operators are less professional so that public services in the field of transportation are still far from the expectations of the community. For example, poor public transport facilities are one of the causes of severe congestion in the city of Bandung, which makes travel time very long. In addition, in one route, several routes are crossed so that there are even collisions between users of the route"³.

b. Drivers and Owners: the Operators

The main interest of public transport operators is the increase in the number of passengers and their income. Thus, the policy of public transportation in Bandung City needs to pay attention to the integration aspects between modes. This means that every mode of public transportation that operates does not turn off other modes of transportation, such as *angkot*, buses, and taxis. To maintain integration between modes of transportation, each has been granted licensing in operationalizing other modes of transportation through route determination and tariff system. Thus, determining the route of each transportation mode is not the same as other modes. For example, *mikrolet* and city bus routes are set differently, although there are few intersections.

In the case of granting route licenses, the determination of the quota is based on the survey results taking into account: population size, potential passenger demand, regional economic potential, and regional potential. The result of interviews with the local government is as follows:

"The arrangement of public transport transportation is one of the government's efforts to encourage the effectiveness of regional economic movements because logistical costs can be reduced, besides that there are several business entities such as Organda, Perum DAMRI and private ope-

² Results of interviews with Public Transport Users in Bandung

Implementation Of Public Transportation Policy In Bandung City: An Analysis Of Actors And Interests
(Arief Moelia Edi)

³ The results of interviews with the community users of public transport services in Bandung City

rators that we must also move as supporting components in the transportation business."⁴

The operators are actually aware of the public's desire to get comfortable public transportation. However, according to them, rejuvenation and the addition of public transportation are not easy because there is no mention of the investment calculation in determining public transport fares. Ideally according to the advice of one of the informants:

"First, there is a subsidy for bus transportation for lower class citizens through various tax incentives. This can offset the impact of low tariff setting and make transport service entrepreneurs unable to procure vehicles or rejuvenate. Secondly, what the government must do is the arrangement of public transport routes that are currently overlapping. Arterial Roads which are supposed to be passed by large buses, are now also passed by public transport microbus."⁵

However, the policy of structuring public transport in Bandung City paid little attention to the economic interests of public transport operators. The current policy is more often expressed in programs and activities that are physical in nature. As a result, drivers tend not to adhere to the policy of structuring public transport transportation because their economic interests are less noticed. For example, construction and repair of roads, infrastructure and transportation facilities such as passenger terminals whose conditions are generally chaotic, tend to be uncomfortable and not well-maintained, lack security and cause traffic congestion, and even turn into a market function.

From a number of informants the interviewees said that, the obligation to queue for public transportation in the official terminal made drivers lose time, which meant losing their income and deposit targets. Another reason is the large amount of levies at the terminal, especially informal levies. As a result, the city bus crews are reluctant to enter the terminal because they are considered to be a waste of time, even passengers themselves waiting at the terminal exit site. Many vehicles crash outside the terminal and create a kind of shadow terminals that result in other public vehicle

traffic jams. The member of operators association (*Organda*) of Bandung City said as follows:

"Ideally the terminal must be made safe and comfortable for passengers and prospective passengers. But in reality, the existing terminal is chaotic. Public force vehicles parked not on track. This happened because the construction of the terminal was not in accordance with the needs and interests of the drivers of public transport. Terminals should be designed and built based on the needs and movement of passengers. The construction of the terminal must also be integrated with the development of spatial planning and transportation systems in the city of Bandung. The appearance of many shadow terminals shows that terminal arrangement is not optimal, not in accordance with the node and movement of passengers."⁶

c. Government Agencies: the Regulators

The City Government of Bandung, both the Mayor and the *Dinas Perhubungan* are the important actor in the policy. They have an interest to immediately create a public transportation system to solve the congestion. The objectives are to make it as a catalyst for economic growth in other sectors. In this case, the role of the government in service has a position as the provider, policy makers and regulator of service standards. Public services in the field of transportation are carried out by specified requirements and procedures as well as certain professional standards.

Although the government has good intentions and objectives, they often carry out the policy. Programs and activities relating to direct appointment are often a means for the legislature to accommodate their party's interests. As the next informant explained, explained:

"In the arrangement of official transportation we communicate with stake-holders. We do have the authority to issue route licenses, also issue recommendations for taxi businesses. But sometimes we cannot avoid if there is pressure from both the leadership and some DPRD members who represent certain parties that demand the allocation of permits and even projects for the

⁴ Results of an Interview with the Regional Secretary of Bandung City

⁵ Results of Interview with members of the *Organda* Board

⁶ Results of Interview with members of *Organda* board

benefit of the community (actually constituents) in their electoral districts. In executing a policy there are often conflicts even when regional regulations are being drafted, especially when it will be implemented."⁷

The conflict at the time of policy formulation can occur, one of which is due to the failure of the representation space in the legislature caused by political party problems. The party that is supposed to carry out the transformation of cadres is still trapped in institutional stagnation because many candidates rely on their profiles rather than party ideology. The issue of the party's contribution to direct post-conflict local election needs to be placed as one of the independent variables that make a large contribution in the ongoing conflict of interest.

It was also found the fact that in implementing the policy of structuring public transport transportation, the local government was often faced with a situation that was less favorable due to external pressure. The form of policy constraints in this infrastructure generally occurs in an effort to regulate public transport vehicles, car body, driver, and others. In the results of interviews with other informants explained that:

"Some of our transportation programs dealing with many individual interests in other institutions, such as the prosecutor, who brought up the programs that have been completed it has even been declared clean without any technical or administrative irregularities by the BPK. Not to mention the efforts to look for mistakes made by reporters and NGOs greatly disrupt the implementation of the follow-up programs listed on the APBD, time and energy are spent serving non-technical constraints like this."⁸

It appears that in the implementation of the policy, even the government apparatus did not escape the interest to obtain certain material benefits. Often local governments must prepare non-budgetary funds to meet these interests, which are feared to reduce the quality of programs and activities, because the allocation of funds to cover such interests is certainly not allocated in the regional budget.

The policy is operated by the *Dinas Perhubungan*. The operationalization of the policy is outlined in a set of rules known as Standard Operating Procedures. The standard operating procedure is a procedure commonly used to deal with the general situation by public and private organizations. With the SOP uniforming the actions of executors and officials in complex and broad organizations, which can turn solid, it can lead to flexibility in implementing regulations. Then another informant explained:

"The lack of resources needed to implement the policy will be helped by the use of SOPs. For example, the supporting documents needed for the submission of business license extensions for public transport operators must meet the requirements according to established procedures. However, SOPs may hinder the implementation of new policies that require new ways of working or new criteria to be implemented."⁹

The greater the policy requires changes in the usual ways of an organization, the greater the probability of hindering the procedures. Many factors can influence the bureaucrat violation. Firmness and law enforcement on the highway are expected to have a positive impact on the smooth flow of traffic. Unfortunately, the role of traffic police officers in enforcing the discipline of road users is still not satisfactory. The police attitude is often not strict with traffic violations. Meanwhile, moral hazard for motorists often tarnishes the professionalism of traffic police. The issue of bribery between traffic violators and traffic police remains a daily story. In the public eye, traffic police are more likely to find fault with road users so that they seem to violate traffic rules rather than building a good traffic culture. It is unfortunate indeed, efforts to uphold discipline are often followed by certain tolerance that is mutually beneficial. Efforts to find fault and trap the road users rarely lead to legal proceedings. It seems that the habit of traffic police accepting these bribes has sacrificed many of the ideals of police institutions in upholding the discipline and rules of traffic on the highway. In addition to tarnishing the image of

⁷ Results of an Interview with the Head of *Dinas Perhubungan Kota Bandung*

⁸ Results of an Interview with the Officers *Dinas Perhubungan Kota Bandung*

⁹ Results of an Interview with the *Dinas Perhubungan Kota Bandung*

the institution, the practice of bribery also reduced their own performance in carrying out their duties.

To understand the causes of the behavior, among others, the lack of limited funding sources, such as in the form of incentives that might be able to motivate the actions of the implementers to implement substantive policies better. Related to the description, other informants stated as follows:

"In their day-to-day duties, the police and transportation office officials indeed interact with the community so that it is natural that they are vulnerable to negative perceptions. So, what emerges here is the subjective dimension, not objective. Therefore, the role of highway users plays an important role in the implementation of transportation arrangements, the community should not dissolve to fertilize the culture of corrupt field officers."¹⁰

In addition, the other informants from the public transport user community explained as follows:

"My impression of the police is that" servants are actually asking to be served "because the practice of illegal levies still occurs. Likewise, the official of the transportation office who is on duty in the field, sometimes the officers carry out carlocking actions to control illegal parking. But the action stopped until the trial, without any special measures to regulate the corps and parking attendants so that they could curb illegal parking."

" 11

CONCLUSION

If we look at the policy of public transportation in the city of Bandung, it can be concluded that the actors and interests affected can be classified into three main groups, namely: community as service users; drivers and public transport owners as operators; and local governments and DPRD as regulators. The main interest of the community is the creation of a cheap and convenient public transport system. Public transport operators generally want an improvement in tariff system as well as subsidy from the government. Public transport operators feel that given the existence of clear subsidies and route

arrangements, their economic interests in getting decent income are not threatened by low transport rates. The real weak point is from the government as a regulator, which only focuses on the development of physical transportation facilities without being balanced with good regulations, especially regarding subsidies and route arrangements. The problem becomes increasingly complicated when there is political interest and maneuvers of local political actors.

REFERENCES

- Grindle, Merilee S, 1980. *Politics and Policy Implementation in The Third Worlds*. New York: Princeton University Press.
- Hoogwood, Brian W., and Lewis A. Gunn 1986. *Policy Analysis for the Real World*. Princeton: Princeton University Press
- O'Toole, Laurence, J., Jr. 1987. *Public Policy Implementation: Evaluation of The Field and Agenda for Future Research. Public Policy Research: Vol 7 No. I*. New York. St. Martin's Press.
- Pradono, Ibnu Syabri and Budhy T. Soegijanto. 2013. *Embracing Paratransit in Bandung Metropolitan Area, West Java, Indonesia*. Washington, UN Habitat.
- Weaver, Kent R. 2009. *Target Compliance: The Final Frontier of Policy Implementation*. Washington DC. The Brookings Institution.

¹⁰ Results Interview with member of *Organda* Board

¹¹ The results of interviews with the community