

ONE DOOR INTEGRATED SERVICE EFFECTIVENESS IN IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES IN THE CITY OF DEPOK WEST JAVA

Triwijaya Darwis*

Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri

*Correspondence: triwijayaamran@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

received
revised
accepted

Keywords:

Public Service; One Stop
Integrated Service;
Effectiveness

ABSTRACT

Public services in the Office of Investment and Integrated Services One Door (PMPTSP) Depok city has mostly used online applications and there are still certain licensing arrangements conducted face-to-face with restrictions on working hours due to pandemic conditions. The research was conducted using qualitative methods with inductive approaches whose data analysis is case-based. Effectiveness measured according to Gibson can be reviewed from several aspects, namely: Productivity, Efficiency, Satisfaction, Adaptation and Development. The results of this study concluded that the effective implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services (PTSP) in improving quality public services in Depok, West Java. However, there are some obstacles faced, namely the lack of quality and quantity of Human Resources in the Depok City PMPTSP Office that has not been comparable to the number of people served. Another obstacle is the limitation of infrastructure and budget due to budget cuts of 30% in 2020. Efforts made by the Depok City PMPTSP Office in improving the effectiveness of one-stop integrated services, namely by optimizing licensing applications through online licensing Si Mpok and cooperation with the Tax Office in the validation of KSWP (Confirmation of Taxpayer Status) for the integration of the system, so that checking the status of taxpayers can be done directly via the licensing application. This research suggests to further optimize the effectiveness of One Door Integrated Services with increased productivity and quality of service; providing efficient service in accordance with the predetermined time; ensure community satisfaction by providing the services expected by the community; and the development of quality services that can all be accessed online including IMB management services, as well as improving the quantity and quality of human resources of one-stop integrated service managers.

INTRODUCTION

Public service is one manifestation of the function of the state apparatus as a public servant in addition to being a servant of the state and aims to improve the welfare of the community. This means that people are increasingly aware of what are their rights and obligations as citizens in the life of society, nation and state. In conditions of an increasingly brave and critical society, the state apparatus must be able to provide public services that are more professional, effective, simple, transparent, open, timely and

responsive and at the same time can build human qualities in the sense of increasing the capacity of individuals and communities to actively determine their future. themselves (Effendi in Widodo, 2001).

In the regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 138 of 2017 concerning the Implementation of One Stop Regional Integrated Services, it is stated that the One Stop Integrated Service, hereinafter abbreviated as PTSP, is an integrated service in a single process starting from the application stage to the completion stage of

service products through one door. The implementation of Regional PTSP aims to improve the quality of PTSP, realize legal protection and certainty for the community; provide wider access to the community to obtain excellent service; and increase the ease of doing business and regional competitiveness. In article 3 of the regulation, it is stated that the target of implementing Regional PTSP is the realization of PTSP that is fast, easy, transparent, definite, simple, affordable, professional, with integrity, and increasing the rights of the community to obtain licensing and non-licensing services.

Furthermore, West Java Governor Regulation Number 1 of 2018 concerning Regulations for the Implementation of One Stop Integrated Services explains that PTSP is a One Stop Integrated Service Office. Chapter 1 article 1 states that One Stop Service, hereinafter abbreviated as PTSP, is an integrated service in a single process starting from the application stage to the stage of completing the service product through one door.

However, the implementation of one-stop integrated services at the Depok City PMPTSP Service encountered several obstacles including limited human resources in terms of quantity and quality. Several other problems are in the form of still licensing arrangements that are carried out face-to-face without going through an online application, restrictions on working hours for licensing arrangements that are carried out face-to-face at the PMPTSP Service, there are still people who do not know if licensing arrangements can be done online and there are still There were 42 public service complaints related to licensing reports in the city of Depok in 2019 and 47 in 2020.

Although Depok City has received a high compliance award for public services in 2019 but data from the Ombudsman that throughout 2019, there were 31 public reports related to public services in Depok City, one of which was a licensing problem. The Depok City PMPTSP Service also encountered obstacles, namely technical problems in terms of internet network speed, so processing data online took a long time. In addition to limiting working hours during the pandemic for licensing arrangements that are carried out face-to-face, it turns out that there are still many people who do not understand the online

registration procedure. This causes delays in the process of completing the submitted application due to the accumulation of files that must be completed.

METHOD

The research method is used in order to review, develop, and test the truth to find a scientific knowledge. The research methods that can be used are very diverse, of course the method to be chosen must be appropriate and closely related to the procedures, tools, and research design that will be carried out by the researcher. This research was conducted by collecting and analyzing data from field findings and presenting them descriptively. The data presented is not just visible and spoken data, but also data that contains a holistic meaning behind the visible and spoken data. The form of the report in this study is in the form of descriptive writing about the implementation of One Stop Services (PTSP) in Depok City, West Java Province.

This research is carried out by researchers using a qualitative approach as stated by Hennink, Hutter and Bailey (2010: 31) that: Qualitative research is a broad umbrella that includes various techniques and philosophies, so it is not easy to determine. In a broad sense qualitative research is an approach that allows you to examine people's experiences in detail, using a specific set of research methods such as in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, observation, content analysis, visual methods and life histories or biographies.

Qualitative research can be used for a wide variety of applications. Qualitative methods are usually used to provide an in-depth understanding of research issues from the perspective of the research population and the context in which they live. Qualitative research is useful for exploring new topics or understanding complex problems; to explain people's beliefs, and identify norms or and society. (Hennink, Hutter and Bailey 2010:32). In this study, the researcher uses qualitative research with an inductive approach because in this study it will depart from empirical facts in the field and then be associated with various relevant theories.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The Effectiveness of One Stop Integrated Services in Improving the Quality of Public Services in Depok City, West Java

1. Productivity

Productivity is an organization's ability to produce the quantity and quality of output in accordance with environmental demands. This includes work processes, work results, work quality, work quantity and production time. The Depok City One Stop Integrated Service and Investment Service is authorized to serve in accordance with the Perda on Licensing and Non-Licensing. Within a period of 12 months during 2020, Depok City DPMPTSP has carried out services for 17,386 types of licensing and non-licensing. It can be seen that the most widely issued types of permits are billboard installation permits, which are 5345. As explained at the beginning of Chapter IV, Depok City shows a shift in economic structure that is increasingly leading to a city of trade and services.

The development of Depok City as a buffer for the nation's capital can be seen from the high level of licensing services related to housing, which are in the second and third highest service order. The service for building permits for single residential buildings is 3769 and permits for use of single residential space are 2493. The above reflects the high productivity of the Depok City DPMPTSP in providing services even in conditions of a pandemic because most of the service providers have used online services.

2. Efficiency

Efficiency according to Gibson (1984:32) is defined as the ratio (ratio) between output and input. This short-term criterion focuses on the entire input-process-output cycle, however, this criterion emphasizes the input and process elements. Efficiency measures expressed in terms of the ratio of profits and costs or with output or with time are a general form of this measure. Ideally, the service will be efficient if the service bureaucracy can provide service inputs, such as the cost and time of service that makes it easier for the community as service users, especially in obtaining licensing and non-licensing services at the Depok City PMPTSP Service. Likewise, on the service output side, the bureaucracy can ideally

provide quality service products, especially from the aspect of cost and time service.

The measure of efficiency can be measured by three indicators, namely saving, meeting expectations, and fairness. It is important that licensing procedures are carried out as part of a series of efforts to promote cost and time efficiency. Services with the One Stop Integrated System or PTSP (one day services) make the permit issuance time shorter. This is, among other things, due to the fact that information technology-based administration of data input can only be done once and administration can be done simultaneously. Since January 2018 the Depok City DPMPTSP has implemented online licensing services through SiMPOK (Depok City Licensing System) with the access address licensingonline.depok.go.id.

The government's step in establishing PTSP which aims to provide cheap, easy, and fast services is an efficient service, especially for licensing and non-licensing services which have been recognized as complicated and lengthy. This business is a prime solution for the community and other decision makers because it has the advantages of being fast, easy, transparent, free from unofficial fees, and has legal certainty and professional services. The results of the interview Researchers concluded that the Depok City PMPTSP Service had tried to provide timely services and made it easier for the community to use online-based applications, but there were still technical obstacles that were sometimes encountered in its implementation by the Depok City PMPTSP Service, such as the need to provide prior understanding to the public in using online applications and there are still licensing arrangements that have not used the online system, namely the processing of building permits or better known as IMBs.

3. Satisfaction

Satisfaction is the preparation of the concept of paying attention to the benefits received by the participants and by the customers. The measure of satisfaction includes the comfort and complaints felt by the community. In providing quality services, the Depok City PMPTSP Service strives to provide services that can make the community comfortable. Both in terms of service and in terms of the condition of the Depok City PMPTSP Service.

Based on the interviews conducted, it can be concluded that the services provided by the Depok City PMPTSP Service have been benefited by the use of online licensing applications by the people of Depok City.

Furthermore, to review community satisfaction, the presence or absence of community complaints is reviewed. It is a benchmark in the improvement of services provided by the Depok City PMPTSP Service. The government as a public servant is the executor of public services, so that public services must satisfy the community. With the establishment of services with the One Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) system, licensing and certificate matters are easier because they only need to be managed in one office. This facility must be supported by the quality of service of the officers. Where improvements in public services are carried out by looking at various elements, so as to create effective and quality services so as to create satisfaction to the community.

The level of community satisfaction assessed through the IKM did not change much in the last 3 years from 2017 to 2019. The performance of the PMPTSP Service also did not see much change even in the percentage of permit applications issued according to the SOP, decreased by 4 points in 2018 and only increased by 1 point in 2018, 2019. However, the complaints that were followed up were all resolved 100% in 2017 to 2019 with the average permit completion time getting faster every year.

From the results of the interview, it can be concluded that the complaints received by the Department of PMPTSP Depok City regarding the limited human resources can be minimized. With several alternatives provided by the Depok City PMPTSP Service. Complaints or complaints are an important element for the organization of the Depok City PMPTSP Service. Complaints can provide a positive value, where the PMPTSP Service can find out what are its weaknesses in providing services to the community. By knowing this weakness, the organization will be encouraged to improve it by improving the quality of its services. Complaints also encourage the PMPTSP Office to have a better risk management system in place to limit the number of complaints that can become legal claims.

The use of information and communication technology among the government has been carried out. This condition is a good condition for the implementation of responsibilities with open governance and public participation to interactive relationships between sectors in society and business actors. The handling of complaints on services provided by the Depok City PMPTSP Service is an important matter that is relevant to being a focus in improving public services carried out by the Depok City PMPTSP Service. Complaint handling is a method for gradually improving services so that people's expectations of getting fast, easy, cheap, and transparent and non-discriminatory services can be carried out as they should. In addition, handling complaints is a strategy to improve the quality of public services that must be carried out.

4. Adaptation

Adaptability is an organization's ability to interpret the influence of the environment on the organization. Adaptation can also be defined as the organization's ability to respond to changes in the external environment by making internal changes to the organization. Denison and Mirsha (1995) in Casida (2007) state that adaptability can be seen from three indicators, namely creating change, focusing on patients (customer focus), and organizational learning (organizational learning). Change is the ability of the organization to make changes, be able to follow developments and react quickly to trends and anticipate the impact of these changes. Customer focus is the ability of an organization to be able to pay attention to customer satisfaction. And the state of the organization is a process that supports the organization to be able to adapt to change, and be able to grow in a better direction through the creation and application of new things such as knowledge, abilities and competencies as well as being able to transform them to other members. The state of the organization is the organization's ability to receive, translate, and interpret from the external environment into an effort to encourage innovation, acquire knowledge and increase knowledge.

The statement from the interview concluded that the condition of the organization at the PMPTSP Service was able to adapt to changes that occurred, so that

several innovations were carried out to make it easier for the community to carry out licensing and non-licensing at DPMPTSP Depok City with several innovations.

5. Development

The organization is obliged to invest in the organization itself to expand its ability to survive in the long term. The usual development efforts were training programs for management and non-management personnel, but nowadays organizational development has grown in variety and includes a number of psychological and sociological approaches. Considering the timing, it can be said that the effectiveness is short, medium, and long-term. Another aspect of optimal balance is the balance of achieving a reasonable relationship between the criteria in a certain period of time. There is no fixed relationship between production, satisfaction, and efficiency. Likewise, neither research nor actual practice provides a basis for saying that production and satisfaction are positively related. These two sizes can move in the same or opposite directions, depending on the circumstances. Organizational development can be seen in two indicators, namely: organizational resilience and organizational adjustment. The results of the interview concluded that the ability of officers at the PMPTSP Office is an important aspect to provide good services to the community, with the conditions of the community being diverse in their limitations in order to create quality services.

One-Stop Integrated Service Quality

The service is said to be of high quality or satisfactory if the service can meet the needs and expectations of the community. If the community is not satisfied with a service provided, then the service is not of high quality. Therefore, service quality is very important and always focuses on customer satisfaction. To measure the quality of a service received by consumers expressed in the size of the discrepancy between the expectations or desires of consumers with their level of perception. It can be studied that customer satisfaction in this case is the public's perception of the reality of the existing reality, which is compared with existing expectations. In order to be able to assess the extent to which the quality of public services provided

by officers at the PMPTSP Service, there needs to be criteria that indicate whether a given public service can be said to be good or bad, quality or not. In this regard, it can be measured with 5 dimensions, namely: Tangibles, Reliability, Responsiveness, Assurance, and Empathy".

1. Tangible

Tangibles, or direct evidence, are physical facilities, equipment, employees, and communication facilities owned by service providers. Thus, direct evidence is one of the most concrete indicators. Its form is in the form of all facilities that can be seen.

DPMPTSP employees who deal directly with service users or permit applicants will give the first impression of the services provided. The appearance of an employee or service officer who is neat and clean reflects a neat and directed work system, indirectly increasing the applicant's confidence in the services provided. Researchers saw firsthand the appearance of employees at the One-Stop Integrated Service Office on a daily basis who had a neat and directed appearance in accordance with the clothes that had been determined. The atmosphere of the service environment, especially the condition of clean and tidy facilities and infrastructure, indicates the comfort of a service environment.

The results of the interview concluded that a clean office condition will provide a sense of comfort to service users. However, there are still no facilities for providing drinks in the waiting room due to restrictions during the pandemic period, which must follow health protocols. The form of physical services intended in ordinary organizations is how to maximize conditions, facilities, capabilities, and other devices so that they can produce a form of reciprocity that is both felt by PTSP and the community because people who see the services shown by PTSP can be seen directly how the performance is. PTSP, and in the end get feedback directly from the community.

2. Reliability

Reliability is the ability to provide the promised service accurately (accurately) and the ability to be trusted (dependably), to provide services on time, in the same way according to the promised schedule and without making mistakes every time. The

mechanism for issuing a permit has been determined by a time limit starting from the process to issuance until it is received by the applicant. The service process is carried out in a simple way so that your community can obtain the necessary permits. The licensing process is structured at the Depok City PMPTSP Office as seen in the distribution pattern of licensing services. The applicant comes with all the requirements and forms that have been downloaded and filled in, then attaches the conditions that have been determined. The results of the interview concluded that the officers confirmed the community's comments. Indeed, there were officers concerned who were not present due to technical reasons, but the DPMPTSP officers still provided certainty of time.

3. Responsiveness

Responsiveness or responsiveness is the ability or desire of officers to help and provide services needed by service recipients. Letting service recipients wait, especially for no apparent reason, will create a negative impression that shouldn't happen. Unless this error is addressed quickly, it can be a memorable and enjoyable experience. Service requires an ability to quickly respond to complaints submitted by service users, a problem that is anticipated properly and quickly can give a good impression on the community. This includes providing services quickly and accurately and arranging for agreements or receiving services quickly and accurately. Based on interviews, it can be concluded that in obtaining information, officers are responsive in providing answers to the community. This shows that the response/responsiveness given by the PMPTSP Department of Depok City is quite satisfactory for the community in accordance with what is expected by the community.

4. Assurance

Assurance or assurance is the knowledge, courtesy, and ability of service provider officers in providing trust to service users. In this dimension, the ability and behavior of front-office officers in instilling trust and confidence in service users is an important role. Hospitality is one of the most easily measured aspects of service quality. Friendly means smiling a lot and being polite. The results of the study concluded that the

friendly and polite attitude shown by the PMPTSP Office of Depok City, sometimes forgot to be accompanied by greetings to the community. This was confirmed by the researcher, that during observations made at the Depok City PMPTSP Service, there were several officers who did not smile when serving the community applicants and some said greetings to the community. Even though a smile and greeting should be an aspect in building good communication and interaction between the community and officers.

It was concluded that greeting is an important thing and must be carried out by the Depok City PMPTSP Service officer as a servant to the community. But human limitations sometimes make small things trivial. Being polite and friendly needs to be supported by the ability of officers in good and effective communication to be able to understand the needs of service users at the Depok City PMPTSP Service. With good communication and interaction, the information conveyed to the public will be easily accepted and facilitate the service process. Furthermore, the researchers made observations at the Depok City PMPTSP Service in instilling a sense of trust and confidence in the community. From these observations, it is known that with many people who come during the service, the community has been given a sense of security. With the availability of good parking and security personnel. The results of the interview concluded that security has been supported by the presence of security officers, but it is necessary to add guards who can also provide clear information to the public.

5. Empathy

Empathy or empathy is the ability to pay attention to service users individually which includes a duty attitude to understand the needs and difficulties of recipients of good communication, personal attention, ease of communication or relationships. This includes understanding what is desired. This includes activities to understand the wishes of service users, provide individually and get to know users better. To understand the needs of service users and to serve in accordance with what is desired, it is necessary to have a sympathetic attitude from the Depok City PMPTSP Service officers both in speaking and in being supported. with the professionalism of

the staff. Problems that exist during the licensing process should be conveyed in a communicative and friendly language, so that problems can be resolved properly. The results of the interview can be concluded that the desire of the Depok City PMPTSP Service to provide easy services, but is constrained by HR problems. However, the Depok City PMPTSP Service provides good service. The quality of service provided on the first impression is generally from the attitude and speech of the service officer. Sympathetic and friendly attitude is the main capital, as a public servant who should provide good licensing services by taking into account the wishes and needs of the community as service users as long as they are in accordance with applicable provisions and procedures.

Obstacles in implementing One Stop Services

Human resources are the most important aspect for organizations, including for DPMPTSP institutions. The implementation of a one-stop integrated service system will be greatly influenced by the quality of its resources. DPMPTSP human resources are required to have competence both in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes that are in accordance with a community-oriented service culture. In addition, officers are required to have a commitment and a good work ethic and are quick to respond to problems that arise in their work and work environment.

As executor of public services, professional Human Resources (HR) need to be prepared in the context of implementing quality services. The number and quality of human resources are the main keys that can turn weaknesses into strengths and turn challenges into opportunities. The success of service to the community will guarantee good service quality and vice versa. Quality improvement in organizations is not easy. This requires professional leadership and human resources.

It can be concluded from the results of the interview that the number of human resources is still lacking, and to improve the quality of education and training or coaching, this has not been implemented. Service human resources as the key to the success of the performance of public service organizations must get the main attention in improving service quality. Therefore, in addition, the

selection and placement of employees in accordance with their competencies is one of the determinants of the success of public services. In this connection, public service organizations must try to find and place employees and apply the right man on the right place, namely determining the right person in each form and type of service.

Human resources working at the PMPTSP Office are not only required to have technical expertise and skills and mastery of the underlying legislation, but more importantly, good mental attitude and behavior are required, friendly in service, honest, agile and responsible. Considering that the people served will not care about what are the obstacles and obstacles in their work, but they only care about what they need to be served well, easily, cheaply, and quickly.

To increase the quantity and quality of human resources, it can be implemented through, among others:

1. Procurement of Human Resources (recruitment), HR procurement is a process of announcement, application, and screening activities up to appointment and placement.
2. Development, To improve the quality of existing human resources in an organization, it is necessary to develop employees. Development is an effort to improve the technical, theoretical, and moral abilities of employees in accordance with the needs of the job/position through education from training.

Facilities and infrastructure are equipment and facilities needed in the implementation of services. Facilities are also one of the important aspects in providing quality services. The availability of adequate facilities and infrastructure will support the improvement of service quality because it is a supporting facility that is needed by every organization, including the Depok City PMPTSP Office in providing services.

Based on the results of interviews, it can be concluded that the facilities and infrastructure available at the Depok City PMPTSP Service are not optimal. The need for the provision of supporting infrastructure by the Depok City PMPTSP Service to improve the quality and smoothness of the service process. Quality service is a

manifestation of the implementation of a change for the better. Increasing the provision of facilities and infrastructure will accelerate the process of licensing and non-licensing services at the Depok City PMPTSP Service so that it can produce performance productivity to meet service standards. The need for facilities and infrastructure can be adjusted to the service, the scale of licensing that is the authority of the Depok City PMPTSP Service and the volume of services that are managed.

CLOSING

Effectiveness of the Implementation of One Stop Integrated Services in improving quality public services in Depok City, West Java Province. This can be seen from the level of satisfaction of the people who receive services from several dimensions of measuring the effectiveness of one-stop integrated services. There are several obstacles that become problems in the implementation of the One Stop Integrated Service in improving the quality of public services at the Depok City PMPTSP Service, based on the results of the study identified several obstacles, namely: Lack of quantity in terms of the number of Human Resources of Depok City PMPTSP Service is not comparable with the number of residents need services in Depok City and based on the quality of Human Resources in terms of the number of complaints from the public as service users and there are still limited infrastructure and budget constraints due to a 30% budget cut in 2020.

REFERENCE

- Abdul Wahab, Solichin. 1997. *Evaluasi Kebijakan Publiik*. Malang : FIA UNIBRAW dan IKIP
- Agustino, Leo. 2006. *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung : CV Alva Beta
- Ardial. 2014. *Paradigma dan Model Penelitian Komunikasi*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Arikunto, S. 2009. *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Edisi Revisi 6. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta
- Bernard, Russeli H. 2011. *Research Methods in Anthropology*, 5th ed. Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press
- Bogdan, R.C., & Biklen, S.K. 1982. *Qualitative Research for Education: An introduction to theory and methods* (Third Edition). Boston: Allyn and Bacon
- _____. 2007. *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods* (5th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education
- Bryson, J.M.,2003. *Strategic Perencanaan Strategis Bagi Organisasi Sosial*, edisi ke-1, M. Mittahuddin, Cetakan ke-5, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar
- Calderon, Jose F, Expectation C Gonzales. 1993. *Method of Research and Thesis Writing*. Madaluyung City. National Book Store.
- Corbetta, P. 2003. *Participant Observation in P. Corbetta, Social Research: Theory, Methods and Techniques*. California: Sage Publications.
- Davis, Keith, dan Newstorm. 1996. *Perilaku Dalam Oraganisasi*. Edisi Tujuh. Jakarta: Erlangga
- Dwijowijoto, Riant Nugroho. 2004. *Kebijakan Publik Formulasi, Implementasi dan Evaluasi*. Jakarta : PT. Elex Media Komputindo Kelompok Gramedia.
- Dwiyanto, Agus. 2007. *Reformasi Birokrasi Publik di Indonesia*, Yogyakarta: UGM Press
- Gasperz, Vincent. 1997. *Manajemen Kualitas Dalam Industri Jasa*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- Gibson, Ivancevich, Donnelly. 1984. *Organisasi dan Manajemen* edisi terjemahan. Jakarta: Erlangga
- Given, M Lisa. 2008. *The Sage Encyclopedia of qualitative research Methods*. Charles Sturt University, Australia
- G. J.Renier, Oscar Wilde (London: Peter Davis 1933), 164pp., rep. as Do . (London: Thomas Nelson 1938), 164pp., bibl
- Goddard, W.& Melville, S. (2004). *Research Methodology: An Introduction*, 2nd edition, Blackwell Publishing
- Gorton, Michael Et.al.2005. *Guide to Complain Handling in Health Care Services* . Australia: William Troedel & cCo Pty Ltd
- Indrawijaya, Adam Ibrahim. 2010. *Teori, Perilaku, dan Budaya Organisasi*. Bandung: PT. Refika Aditama
- Kurniawan, Agung. 2005. *Transformasi Pelayanan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Pembaharuan

Lukman, Sampara. 1999. Manajemen Kualitas Pelayanan. Jakarta: STIA LAN Press
Macharia Waruingi. Dissertation Mentoring handbook 2, Strategi For Qualitative Research
Merriam , S.B. 2001. Dalam Qualitative Research And Case Study Applications

in Education. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass
Miles, M.B., Huberman, A.M. (1994) Qualitative Data Analysis. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.